Business Ready

Methodology Handbook

May 2023

About the Methodology Handbook

Business Ready (B-READY) is an international benchmarking project developed by the World Bank Group. B-READY provides a quantitative assessment of the business environment for private sector development, published annually and covering most economies worldwide. B-READY data and summary report aim to advocate for policy reform, inform specific policy advice, and provide data for development policy research. Through its focus on private sector development, B-READY contributes to meeting the World Bank Group's twin goals of eliminating poverty and boosting shared prosperity.

B-READY assesses an economy's business environment by focusing on the regulatory framework and the provision of related public services directed at firms and markets, as well as the efficiency with which regulatory framework and public services are combined in practice. B-READY seeks a balanced approach when assessing the business environment: between ease of conducting a business and broader private sector benefits, between regulatory framework and public services, between de jure laws and regulations and de facto practical implementation, and between data representativeness and data comparability. B-READY covers the areas where it can provide the most value added in the context of existing indicators: namely, the regulatory framework and related public services at the microeconomic level.

B-READY focuses on ten topics that are organized following the life cycle of the firm and its participation in the market while opening, operating (or expanding), and closing (or reorganizing) a business. The main topics include Business Entry, Business Location, Utility Services, Labor, Financial Services, International Trade, Taxation, Dispute Resolution, Market Competition, and Business Insolvency. Within each topic, considerations relevant to the business environment regarding aspects of the adoption of digital technology, environmental sustainability, and gender are captured. Based on the data collected, B-READY generates scores for each topic area and potentially a set of aggregate scores. B-READY collects both de jure information and de facto measures. While de jure data are collected from expert consultations, de facto data are collected from both expert consultations and firm surveys. The latter is a major innovation and represents a significant increase in the data available to WBG teams, development practitioners, and researchers around the world. Data collection and reporting processes are governed by the highest possible standards of integrity, including sound data gathering processes, robust data safeguards, clear approval protocols, transparency and public availability of granular data, and replicability of results.

The B-READY Methodology Handbook first presents the objectives, scope, and approach of the project. It then provides a full description of the project's methodology, including motivation, indicators, questionnaires, and scoring guidelines per topic. The B-READY methodology will be subject to refinements in the first three data collection and reporting cycles, as the project expands its economy coverage and moves from pilot to full-fledged project.

Table of Contents

About the Methodology Handbook

Chapter 1 – Overview

Chapter 2 – Business Entry

Chapter 3 – Business Location

Chapter 4 – Utility Services

Chapter 5 – Labor

Chapter 6 – Financial Services

Chapter 7 – International Trade

Chapter 8 – Taxation

Chapter 9 – Dispute Resolution

Chapter 10 – Market Competition

Chapter 11 – Business Insolvency

Annex A – City Selection Parameter

CHAPTER 3. BUSINESS LOCATION

METHODOLOGY NOTE

I. MOTIVATION

Acquiring the physical space where a business will operate is a crucial ingredient of success for many firms, even in the digital age. Getting the right location can influence business access to customers, transportation, labor, and materials, as well as determine taxes, regulations, and environmental commitments they must comply with. Whether an entrepreneur is leasing or purchasing a commercial property, the regulatory framework and the public services related to acquiring a location can have an impact on how conducive the business environment is for individual firms and private sector development of an economy. Firms are more likely to invest in economies with strong property rights, where they can be confident that their investment in immovable property will be safe. Looking at how well administration of property rights functions gives a good indication of the economy's prospects for economic growth and provides confidence to the private sector in investing in strategic locations for businesses. Quality and transparency of land administration are also vital in reducing information asymmetries and increasing market efficiency. A reliable land administration system provides clear information on property ownership, facilitates development of real estate markets, and supports security of tenure.

When investors and entrepreneurs acquire a new location for their business, the process often involves licensing requirements for altering a property or changing tenancy. Building-related permits are essential for public safety, strengthening property rights, and contributing to capital formation. Last, but not least, transparent and accessible environmental regulations related to building control reduce regulatory burden on firms by offering clarity on rules and regulation.

In this context, the Business Location topic measures the effectiveness of the regulatory framework, the quality of governance and the transparency and efficiency in providing services for property transfer, building and environmental permits. The topic indicators consider both the perspective of the firm/entrepreneur (firm flexibility) and the broader public (social benefits). Most of the indicators under the regulatory framework pillar and the public services pillar measure both firm flexibility and social benefits, while indicators under the efficiency pillar relate mainly to firm flexibility.

II. INDICATORS

The Business Location topic measures three different options—purchase, lease, or build—that are available to entrepreneurs to choose the adequate location to set up their company, across three different dimensions, here referred to as pillars. The first pillar assesses the effectiveness of regulations pertaining to property transfer, building permitting and environmental permitting, covering de jure features of a regulatory framework that are necessary for the quality of regulations for immovable property lease, property ownership, and urban planning. The second pillar assesses the quality of public services and the transparency of information in the provision of property transfer, building and environmental permitting. The third pillar measures the efficiency of obtaining a business location in practice. Each pillar is divided into categories—defined by common features that inform the grouping into a particular category—and each category is further divided into subcategories. Each subcategory consists of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, have several components. Relevant points are assigned to each indicator and subsequently aggregated to obtain the number of points for each subcategory, category, and pillar. Table 1 includes a summary of all three pillars—property transfer, building permitting, environmental permitting—along with their respective categories and subcategories.

Table 1. Summary table of all three pillars for Business Location

1. IMMOVABLE PROPERTY TRANSFER, URBAN PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITTING

Table 2 shows the structure for Pillar I, the regulatory framework guiding the acquisition or establishment of a business in a specific location. Each of this pillar's categories and subcategories will be discussed in more detail below, following the structure of this table.

Table 2. Pillar I-Quality of Regulations for Immovable Property Transfer, Urban Planning and

Environmental Permitting

| 1.1 | Regulatory Standards for Land Administration | |
|-------|--|--|
| 1.1.1 | Property Transactions Standards | |
| 1.1.2 | Land Dispute Resolution Mechanisms | |
| 1.1.3 | Land Administration System | |
| 1.2 | Restrictions on Property Lease and Ownership | |
| 1.2.1 | Restriction for Domestic Firms to Lease Property | |
| 1.2.2 | Restriction for Domestic Firms to Own Property | |
| 1.2.3 | Restriction for Foreign Firms to Lease Property | |
| 1.2.4 | Restriction for Foreign Firms to Own Property | |
| 1.3 | Gender | |
| 1.3.1 | Gender incentives for professional participation | |
| 1.4 | Regulatory Standards for Building Regulations and Environmental Licenses | |
| 1.4.1 | Building Regulations Standards | |
| 1.4.2 | Building Energy Codes and Standards | |
| 1.4.3 | Zoning and land use planning | |
| 1.4.4 | Environmental Clearances in Construction | |
| 1.4.5 | Dispute Mechanisms for Building Permits and Environmental Clearances in Construction | |

1.1 Regulatory Standards for Land Administration

Category 1.1 has three subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, consist of several components.

1.1.1 Property Transaction Standards

A sound regulatory framework is essential to ensure secure property transactions. Having processes that ascertain rightful ownership and registration of sale deeds in the immovable property registry increases security for people.⁵ Effective property transaction standards can improve efficiency and transparency of property transactions, reduce costs, and increase accuracy of property information.⁶ Therefore, Subcategory 1.1.1–Property Transaction Standards has four indicators (table 3).

Table 3. Subcategory 1.1.1-Property Transaction Standards

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|--|---|
| 1 | Legal obligation to check compliance of documents with the law | Requiring a control of legality of the documents necessary for a property transaction |
| 2 | Legal obligation to verify identities of parties | Requiring verification of the identity of each party engaged in a property transaction |
| 3 | Legal obligation to register sales transactions | Requiring that all property sale transactions be registered at the land registry to make them opposable to third parties |
| 4 | Legality of online documents | i) Property title certificate ii) Title search certificate iii) Tax certificate iv) Company profile document v) Cadastral plans |

1.1.2 Land Dispute Resolution Mechanisms

In some economies, land disputes make up most of the volume of court cases. To prevent land disputes and better manage the existing ones, the legal framework for land administration needs to assign clear responsibilities to stakeholders involved in land transactions as well as provide effective mechanisms of dispute resolution that can be implemented in a consistent way and be accessible to all. Disputes can also occur due to errors in title registration, resulting in significant losses to affected parties, including property owners and lenders. To complement that, available evidence suggests that offering an out-of-court compensation mechanism has the potential of reducing court cases. Therefore, Subcategory 1.1.2—Land Dispute Resolution Mechanisms has four indicators (table 4).

Table 4. Subcategory 1.1.2-Land Dispute Resolution Mechanisms

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Legal provisions for arbitration as an alternative land disputes resolution mechanism | Arbitration offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for land disputes |
| 2 | Legal provisions for conciliation and mediation as alternative land disputes resolution mechanisms | Conciliation and mediation offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for land disputes |
| 3 | Legal provisions to provide out- of- court compensation for losses due to erroneous information from the land registry | Out-of-court compensation mechanism to allow for compensation payments to parties who suffer losses due to an error in title registration |
| 4 | Legal provisions for protection of property title | Property title subject to a guarantee |

1.1.3 Land Administration System

Having a reliable, transparent, and secure land registration system is important to support the security of land tenure and facilitates development of an efficient land market. Such a system must provide clear and accurate information on land ownership, boundaries, and land use rights to all stakeholders, including government agencies, landowners, investors, and the public.¹⁰ The higher the quality of the land administration system, the higher the chance of getting credit when using property as collateral, thereby increasing incentives for investment. Good practices include having transparency of information because it eliminates the asymmetry of information between users and officials and increases the efficiency of land markets,¹¹ as well as a sound infrastructure to maintain land information supported by an appropriate institutional framework.¹² Therefore, Subcategory 1.1.3–Land Administration System has three indicators (table 5).

Table 5. Subcategory 1.1.3-Land Administration System

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|-----------------------------|--|
| 1 | Disclosure of land registry | Legal framework specifies who can obtain information on land ownership at the |
| 1 | information | immovable property |
| | Disclosure of cadastral | I and from a work movides who can consult adopted plans of missate land plats |
| 2 | information | Legal framework provides who can consult cadastral plans of private land plots |
| 2 | Infrastructure for land | Existence of cadaster/mapping agency (institution in charge of surveying each plot |
| 3 | administration | of land) |

1.2 Restrictions on Property Lease and Ownership

Category 1.2 has four subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, consist of several components.

1.2.1 Restriction for Domestic Firms to Lease Property

Restrictions for domestic firms to lease properties, whether based on zoning or land use regulations, can impact the decision of a firm on where to establish a business.¹³ Leasing restrictions on land can limit the

ability of domestic firms to acquire a property, which can hinder their growth and development.¹⁴ Therefore, Subcategory 1.2.1–Restriction for Domestic Firms to Lease Property has five indicators (table 6).

Table 6. Subcategory 1.2.1–Restriction for Domestic Firms to Lease Property

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|--|--|
| 1 | Restriction on the area of the land for lease for domestic firms | Restriction to lease a certain area of land for domestic firms |
| 2 | Restriction on the duration of the lease for domestic firms | Restriction on the duration of lease for domestic firms |
| 3 | Restriction on the location of property for lease for domestic firms | Restriction on the location of property for domestic firms |
| 4 | Restriction on agricultural property for lease for domestic firms | Restriction to lease agricultural land for domestic firms |
| 5 | Restriction on the type of property for lease for domestic firms | Restriction to lease a certain type of building (residential, commercial, industrial) for domestic firms |

1.2.2 Restriction for Domestic Firms to Own Property

Restrictions for domestic firms to own a property limit their ability to access capital and other resources, which can hinder competitiveness and reduce investments.¹⁵ Therefore, Subcategory 1.2.2–Restrictions for Domestic Firms to Own Property has four indicators (table 7).

Table 7. Subcategory 1.2.2–Restriction for Domestic Firms to Own Property

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Restriction on ownership based on the area of the land for domestic firms | Restriction on ownership based on the area of the land for domestic firms |
| 2 | Restriction on the location of property for land ownership for domestic firms | Restriction on the location of property for land ownership for domestic firms |
| 3 | Restriction on ownership of agricultural land for domestic firms | Restriction on ownership of agricultural land for domestic firms |
| 4 | Restriction on ownership by the type of building for domestic firms | Restriction on ownership by the type of building for domestic firms |

1.2.3 Restriction for Foreign Firms to Lease Property

A lease is an agreement between the owner of a property who will allow the lessee to use this property for profit. Some economies have strict rules on the duration of leases, while others allow for a much longer period, usually 99 years. Some other economies leave the duration of the lease to the contractual parties. Restrictions on leasing can hinder the ability of foreign firms to invest in and develop operations in a particular country. Therefore, Subcategory 1.2.3–Restriction for Foreign Firms to Lease Property has five indicators (table 8).

Table 8. Subcategory 1.2.3–Restriction for Foreign Firms to Lease Property

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|--|--|
| 1 | Restriction for foreign firms to lease based on the area of the land | Restriction on lease based on the area of the land for foreign firms |
| 2 | Restriction on the duration of lease for foreign firms | Restrictions on the duration of the lease for foreign firms |
| 3 | Restriction on the location of property leasehold for foreign firms | Restriction on the location of property leasehold for foreign firms |

| 4 | Restriction on the lease of agricultural land for foreign firms | Restriction on the lease of agricultural land for foreign firms |
|---|---|---|
| 5 | Restrictions on foreign firms to lease based on certain type of buildings (residential, commercial, industrial) | Restrictions on foreign firms to lease based on certain type of buildings (residential, commercial, industrial) |

1.2.4 Restrictions for Foreign Firms to Own Property

Economies are divided regarding foreign ownership. In most economies there are at least some kinds of restrictions on foreign ownership, whether it is on agricultural lands or residential properties. Such restrictions can hinder the ability of foreign firms to invest in a particular country, leading to reduced economic performance, lower financial development and absorptive capacity, and reduced investment incentives. Therefore, Subcategory 1.2.4–Restriction for Foreign Firms to Own Property has five indicators (table 9).

Table 9. Subcategory 1.2.4–Restriction for Foreign Firms to Own Property

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Restriction of ownership on the area of the land for foreign firms | Restriction of ownership on the area of land for foreign firms |
| 2 | Restriction on the duration of ownership for foreign firms | Restriction on the duration of ownership for foreign firms |
| 3 | Restriction on property ownership based on location for foreign firms | Restriction on property ownership based on location for foreign firms |
| 4 | Restriction on the ownership of agricultural land for foreign firms | Restriction on the ownership of agricultural land for foreign firms |
| 5 | Restriction on the ownership for foreign firms by certain type of buildings | Restriction on ownership for foreign firms by certain type of buildings (residential, commercial, industrial) |

1.3. Gender

Category 1.3 has one subcategory which has several components.

1.3.1 Gender Incentives for Professional Participation

Several studies have found that gender inequalities in professions related to real estate, construction, and environmental consulting industries have traditionally been male-dominated, with women comprising a small percentage of the workforce. ²⁰ To address this gender imbalance, many companies worldwide offer some incentives—such as training, mentoring, grants, or scholarships—with the aim of decreasing the gender gap in these professions. ²¹ This gender indicator measures whether such incentives exist in economies (table 10).

Table 10. Subcategory 1.3.1–Gender Incentives for Professional Participation

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|--|---|
| 1 | Gender incentives for professional participation | i) Incentives to reduce the gender gap in property related professions ii) Incentives to reduce the gender gap in professions related to obtaining building permits (architects, engineers) iii) Incentives to reduce the gender gap in professions related to environmental licensing (environmental engineers, environmental consultants) |

1.4 Regulatory Standards for Building Regulations and Environmental Licenses

Category 1.4 has five subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, consist of several components.

1.4.1 Building Regulations Standards

Having a defined set of building regulation standards is important to ensure that buildings are constructed, maintained, and used in a way that minimizes the risk of harm to individuals and the environment. Having clear and publicly accessible building regulations, as well as clear regulations regarding safety mechanisms in construction, is key to guaranteeing a safe construction process.²² Therefore, Subcategory 1.4.1–Building Regulation Standards has 13 indicators (table 11).

Table 11. Subcategory 1.4.1-Building Regulations Standards

| | Indicators | Components |
|----|---|--|
| 1 | Building codes/standards applicable to all constructions | Existence of unified building standards |
| 2 | Clear provisions or guidelines regarding safety standards | i) Natural disaster resistant construction (e.g., floods, storms, earthquakes, etc.) ii) Building classification according to certain criteria (e.g., usage; size) iii) Active and passive fire safety measures iv) Soil testing requirements for certain permanent building types v) Structural strength (materials to be used) |
| 3 | Regulation of health risk related to construction materials | Regulatory framework requirements for the handling, removal, and disposal of regulated construction materials that pose health risks (such as asbestos, lead, mercury-containing devices, polychlorinated biphenyls [PCB]) |
| 4 | List of regulated materials | Which materials are regulated: i) Asbestos ii) Lead-containing pipes, components, paints iii) Mercury-containing fluorescent lamps, thermostats, and electric devices iv) Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCB) in electric transformers, fluorescent light ballasts, caulk, and masonry joints |
| 5 | Prohibition of use of construction materials | Which materials are prohibited: i) Asbestos ii) Lead-containing pipes, components, paints iii) Mercury-containing fluorescent lamps, thermostats, and electric devices iv) Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCB) in electric transformers, fluorescent light ballasts, caulk, and masonry joints |
| 6 | Responsibility for compliance with legal requirements | i) Public agency: Certified/licensed engineer or architect ii) Public agency: Somebody other than an architect or engineer iii) Private and external firms of certified architects and/or civil engineers, not part of the building company iv) Internal review by the architect/engineer who prepared the plans |
| 7 | Type of inspections carried out during construction | Requirement of final inspection by law |
| 8 | Requirement of final inspection by law | Requirement of final inspection by law |
| 9 | Inspection of prohibited materials in construction | Legal requirement to inspect if prohibited materials are used in construction |
| 10 | Type of prohibited materials inspected | Which type of prohibited materials are inspected |
| 11 | Liability for structural flaws/problems | i) The architect or engineer who designed the plans of the building ii) The professional or agency, conducting the technical inspections during construction and the final inspection iii) The construction company iv) Liability is not defined by law but is contractual between the involved parties (Contractual Law) |
| 12 | Requirement a to be an architect or engineer | Requirement a to be an architect or engineer |
| 13 | Qualifications to conduct technical supervision/inspections | i) Is an architect or engineer ii) Years of practical experience iii) Member of association of architects or engineers iv) Pass an exam |

Note: PCB = polychlorinated biphenyls.

1.4.2 Building Energy Codes and Standards

Building energy codes and standards are essential tools for promoting energy efficiency and reducing greenhouse gas emissions in the building sector. Building energy codes and standards are regulatory requirements that set minimum energy efficiency requirements for new buildings.²³ Energy efficiency performance standards in building energy codes typically include several key elements, including building envelope requirements, lighting, and heating cooling requirements.²⁴ Therefore, Subcategory 1.4.2—Building Energy Codes and Standards has four indicators (table 12).

Table 12. Subcategory 1.4.2–Building Energy Codes and Standards

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Mandatory minimum energy efficiency performance standards | Mandatory minimum energy efficiency performance standards |
| 2 | Pre-condition to provide proof of design compliance with the energy efficiency performance standards | Pre-condition to provide proof of design compliance with the energy efficiency performance standards |
| 3 | Energy efficiency performance standards are verified as part of the building plans review process | i) Thermal transmittance or insulation calculations for building envelope ii) Solar heat gain calculations for building envelope iii) Glazing factors for fenestration iv) Heating/cooling demand calculations v) Daylighting and orientation vi) Permanent shading vii) Air barrier, air leakage or air infiltration viii) Efficiency of heating and cooling equipment and controls ix) Efficiency of lighting fixtures and controls |
| 4 | Incentives to promote green building standards | Incentives to promote green building standards |

1.4.3. Zoning and Land Use Planning

Zoning is a planning control tool for regulating the built environment and creating functional real estate markets. Effective zoning and land use planning ensures sustainable and safe urban development planning to ensure equitable access to services such as water, electricity, and sanitation.²⁵ Hazard maps and related means are also essential to identify areas where construction of buildings is not permitted due to natural hazards and to determine minimum separation distances between residential and hazardous occupancies.²⁶ Zoning can also provide the opportunity to stimulate or slow down development in specific areas.²⁷ Therefore, Subcategory 1.4.3–Zoning and Land Use Planning has one indicator on land use and zoning regulations (table 13).

Table 13. Subcategory 1.4.3–Zoning and Land Use Planning

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---------------------------------|--|
| | Indicators | Components |
| 1 | Land use and zoning regulations | i) Requirements for trunk infrastructure availability (water, electricity, sanitation) |
| | | ii) Hazard maps or related means that identify areas in which construction is not |
| | | permitted due to natural hazards |
| | | iii) Hazard maps or other tools that identify minimum separation between residential |
| | | and hazardous occupancies |
| | | iv) Maps or related means that identify areas in which construction of buildings is |
| | | not permitted in relation to natural resources |
| | | v) They do not exist |

1.4.4 Environmental Clearances in Construction

Environmental permitting is a critical aspect of construction project planning and management. Studies have shown that obtaining environmental permits can be a time-consuming and complex process, requiring significant resources and expertise.²⁸ However, environmental permits are essential to ensuring that construction projects comply with environmental regulations and standards, and that the potential impacts

on the natural environment are minimized. Construction projects that require environmental permits can have significant impacts on local communities and the broader environment, and the decisions made during the environmental permitting process can have implications for sustainable development.²⁹ The legal framework on environment governing construction projects typically defines low, moderate, or high levels of environmental risk projects based on the potential environmental impacts of the project. The categorization of projects is usually determined through an environmental review process that considers factors such as the project's location, size, and potential impact on natural resources.³⁰ Therefore, Subcategory 1.4.4–Environmental Clearances in Construction has ten indicators (table 14).

Table 14. Subcategory 1.4.4-Environmental Clearances in Construction

| Table | | ronmental Clearances in Construction |
|-------|--|--|
| | Indicators | Components |
| 1 | Existence of national environmental regulations during construction | Existence of national environmental regulations during construction |
| 2 | Update or revision of national environmental regulations during construction | Update or revision of national environmental regulations during construction |
| 3 | Penalties or fines in place for non-compliance with the regulations | Penalties or fines in place for non-compliance with the regulations |
| 4 | Environmental risks as defined by legal framework | Environmental risks as defined by legal framework |
| 5 | Qualified professional/professional agency to conduct EIA | Qualified professional/professional agency to conduct the environmental impact assessment (EIA) |
| 6 | Criteria that trigger an EIA | Screening criteria: i) Extent (size) of project ii) Nature of industry iii) Geographical location |
| 7 | Requirements for an EIA process | i) Scoping and baseline studies (identification of the scope of the assessment, including issues to be addressed and the potential environmental impacts of the proposed project) (assessment of the current environmental conditions and the potential effects of the proposed project on the environment, including air and water quality, biodiversity, and socioeconomic conditions) ii) Impact assessment (identification and evaluation of the potential positive and negative environmental impacts of the proposed project, including direct and indirect impacts, short-term and long-term impacts, and cumulative impacts) iii) Mitigation measures (development of measures to avoid, minimize, or compensate for the negative environmental impacts of the proposed project, and enhancement of positive impacts) and alternative analysis (assessment of feasible alternatives to the proposed project, including the no-action alternative, and evaluation of their potential environmental impacts) iv) Public participation (consultation with the public and other stakeholders to obtain their views on the proposed project and the potential environmental impacts, and consideration of their concerns and suggestions in the decision-making process) v) Monitoring and follow-up (implementation of a monitoring program to verify the accuracy of the impact predictions, and to ensure that the mitigation measures are effective in reducing the negative environmental impacts) |
| 8 | Legal responsibility for checking compliance | i) Internal review (undertaken by the responsible authority or other government agency, with or without formal guidelines and procedure) ii) External review (undertaken by an independent body, separate from and/or outside government agencies, with an open and transparent procedure for public comment) |
| 9 | Legal framework mandates public consultations with concerned stakeholders | Requirement of public consultation with concerned stakeholders |
| 10 | Public consultations requirement elements | Public consultations with concerned stakeholders entail the following requirements: |

| i) Ensuring that the information is provided in a language that is accessible to the |
|--|
| intended audience |
| ii) Disseminating information about the meeting in advance |
| iii) Ensuring that the meeting takes place at a time and place that are appropriate |
| for the stakeholders: |
| iv) Ensuring that the meeting does not take place at a stage where all relevant |
| decisions concerning the project have been made |

Note: EIA = environmental impact assessment.

1.4.5 Dispute Mechanisms for Building Permits and Environmental Clearances in Construction

Dispute mechanism for building permits and environmental clearances in construction can be critical in resolving conflicts that may arise during environmental clearance or obtaining building permits processes. Effective dispute resolution mechanisms should consider interests of all stakeholders and seek to find a fair and equitable solution that balances environmental protection, safety in construction and economic development. Several stakeholders should be involved in these disputes, including project proponents, regulatory authorities, local communities, environmental organizations and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), and government agencies. Therefore, Subcategory 1.4.5–Dispute Resolution Mechanisms for Environmental Clearances in Construction and Building Permits has three indicators (table 15).

Table 15. Subcategory 1.4.5–Dispute Mechanisms for Building Permits and Environmental Clearances in Construction

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Ability to dispute building permit decisions | Ability to dispute building permit decisions |
| 2 | Ability to dispute environmental clearances and permits | Ability to dispute environmental clearances and permits |
| 3 | Out-of-court resolution mechanisms for environmental disputes | i) Arbitration ii) Conciliation iii) Mediation |

2. PILLAR II. PUBLIC SERVICES: QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION

Table 16 shows the structure for Pillar II, the quality of public digital services. Each of this pillar's categories and subcategories will be discussed in more detail in the order shown in the table (table 16).

Table 16. Pillar II-Quality of Public Services and Transparency of Information

| 2.1 | Availability and Reliability of Online Services | |
|-------|---|--|
| 2.1.1 | Property transactions-digital public services | |
| 2.1.2 | Property transactions-reliability of infrastructure | |
| 2.1.3 | Property transactions-coverage | |
| 2.1.4 | Building permits and environmental licenses-digital public services | |
| 2.2 | Interoperability of Services | |
| 2.2.2 | Interoperability for property transactions | |
| 2.2.2 | Interoperability for building permits | |
| 2.3 | Transparency of Information | |
| 2.3.1 | Transparency of information for immovable property | |
| 2.3.2 | Gender data on property ownership | |
| 2.3.3 | Transparency of information for building permits and environmental licenses | |
| 2.3.4 | Transparency of information on zoning and land use | |

2.1 Availability and Reliability of Online Services

Category 2.1 has four subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, consist of several components.

2.1.1 Property Transactions–Digital Public Services

With internet availability in almost every country, publics services can offer secure online services such as due diligence checking and property registration for real estate transactions. Therefore, Subcategory 2.1.1–Availability of Online Services and Reliability of Infrastructure has six indicators (table 17).

Table 17. Subcategory 2.1.1-Property Transactions-Digital Public Services

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|--|--|
| 1 | Online platform encumbrance checking | i) Title search (ownership) ii) Encumbrances (liens, charges) iii) Outstanding taxes (tax agency) iv) Bankruptcy search v) Company profile |
| 2 | Single online platform for encumbrance checking | i) Accurate (precise, no errors) ii) Current (latest information) iii) Detailed (all information provided) iv) Reliable (information can be verified) |
| 3 | Online platform for property transfer | Online platform for property transfer |
| 4 | Processes available online for property transfer | i) Downloading forms ii) Uploading document iii) Getting notifications iv) Obtaining documents v) Processing payment |
| 5 | Complaint mechanisms for immovable property registry | Complaint mechanisms for immovable property registry |
| 6 | Complaint mechanisms for cadaster | Complaint mechanisms for cadaster |

2.1.2 Property Transactions–Reliability of Infrastructure

In a good land management system, the institutional framework must ensure that both the land registry and the mapping system (cadaster) have adequate infrastructure to maintain land information to guarantee high standards and reduce the risk of errors. Good infrastructure is essential for the implementation of land policy and land use planning.³⁴ Digital tools machine learning can provide more accurate and efficient means of verifying the legal, financial, and physical status of a property, which can ultimately lead to better decision-making in real estate transactions.³⁵ Online portals for property transfer can provide more efficient and convenient means of completing real estate transactions, which can ultimately lead to better outcomes for buyers, sellers, and investors.³⁶ Therefore, Subcategory 2.1.2–Property Transactions–Reliability of Infrastructure has five indicators (table 17).

Table 17. Subcategory 2.1.2-Property Transaction-Reliability of Infrastructure

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Electronic database for checking encumbrances | Comprehensive and fully functional electronic database for checking encumbrances: i) Liens ii) Mortgages (charges) iii) Restrictions iv) Easements |
| 2 | Format of land title certificates | Format in which land title certificates kept at the immovable property registry: i) Titles are digitalized (e.g., accessible on the cloud) ii) Titles are digitized (e.g., pdf saved on a computer) |

| 3 | Format of cadastral plans | Format in which the cadastral certificates kept at the mapping agency i) Titles are digitalized (e.g., accessible on the cloud) |
|---|---|--|
| | | ii) Titles are digitized (e.g., pdf saved on a computer). |
| 4 | Method to conduct cadastral surveying | Method used to conduct cadastral surveying: i) Direct (geodesic and topographic in situ) ii) Indirect (photogrammetric–pictures taken from airplanes and drones) iii) Mixed (a combination of the previous two options) |
| 5 | National database for checking identification | National database for checking identification of parties involved in property transactions |
| | Identification | transactions |

2.1.3 Property Transactions–Coverage

The completeness of coverage of all land and property at the immovable property registry is a crucial aspect of effective land management. The immovable property registry is a system used to record and manage information related to land and property ownership. A complete and accurate registry can help prevent disputes, fraud, and other problems related to land ownership.³⁷ Complete or partial coverage of the immovable property registry and the mapping agency (cadaster) may influence the decision of an entrepreneur on where to locate a business. Effective land information systems ensure that the registry and the cadaster make records of all registered private land readily available, and the records cover the entire economy. Therefore, Subcategory 2.1.3–Property Transactions–Coverage has four indicators (table 18).

Table 18. Subcategory 2.1.3-Property Transactions-Coverage

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|--|--|
| 1 | Property registration coverage at main business city level | Property registration coverage at main business city level |
| 2 | Property registration coverage at national level | Property registration coverage at national level |
| 3 | Cadastral coverage at main city level | Cadastral coverage at main city level |
| 4 | Cadastral coverage at national level | Cadastral coverage at national level |

2.1.4 Building Permits and Environmental Licenses-Digital Public Services

Digital public services can help to reduce the time and cost associated with building permit applications, while also increasing transparency and accountability.³⁸ Digital building permitting services can improve communication between various stakeholders, including architects, contractors, and government officials. In addition, digital public services can also improve the quality of the built environment and can help to ensure that building plans meet safety, health, and environmental standards.³⁹ Therefore, Subcategory 2.1.4–Building Permits and Environmental Licenses–Digital Public Services has five indicators (table 19).

Table 19. Subcategory 2.1.4–Building Permits and Environmental Licenses–Digital Public Services

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|--|---|
| 1 | Online platform for issuing building authorizations | i) Online platform for building authorizations and integration of all relevant authorizations from organizations outside of the planning/building departments ii) Online platform for building authorizations and integration of some relevant authorizations from organizations outside of the planning/building departments iii) Online platform for building authorizations but not integration of any relevant authorizations from organizations outside of the planning/building departments |
| 2 | Online permitting systems with several functionalities | i) Online payment ii) Online communication iii) Online notification iv) Online submission v) Auto-generated checklist |

| 3 | Online permitting systems to submit building and occupancy permits | i) Building permit can be obtained onlineii) Occupancy permit can be obtained online |
|---|---|---|
| 4 | Online system to submit environmental licenses | i) Online payment ii) Online communication iii) Online notification iv) Online submission v) Auto-generated checklist |
| 5 | Mechanism available to file a dispute online on the final decision on environmental licensing | Mechanism available to file a dispute online on the final decision on environmental licensing |

2.2 Interoperability of Services

Category 2.2 has two subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, consist of several components.

2.2.1 Interoperability for Property Transactions

Data exchange between the immovable property registry and the mapping agency (cadaster) ensures data accuracy and reduces the risk of mistakes in property data. Interoperability can increase the efficiency of property transactions by reducing the time and resources required to complete them, as well as enhance the accuracy and reliability of property records, which can reduce disputes and errors in property transactions⁴⁰. Interoperability can also help to overcome the challenges posed by fragmented land administration systems, improve the accessibility of land information, and help to overcome the challenges posed by limited resources and capacity in land administration agencies.⁴¹ Therefore, Subcategory 2.2.1–Interoperability for Property Transactions has four indicators (table 20).

Table 20. Subcategory 2.2.1–Interoperability for Property Transactions

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|--|
| 1 | Interoperability between land registry and Cadaster | Information recorded by the immovable property registration agency and the cadastral/mapping agency kept in a (1) single database containing both legal and geographical information; (2) different but linked databases (where information is automatically updated and shared between the two institutions); or (3) separate databases |
| 2 | Interoperability between land registry and other services | Interoperability between land registry and other services |
| 3 | Existence of a Geographic Information System | Existence of a Geographic Information System (GIS) |
| 4 | Existence of a Unique Identifier between land registry and cadaster | Existence of a Unique Identifier between land registry and cadaster |

2.2.2 Interoperability for Building Permits

Interoperability in building permits can improve the efficiency and transparency of the permitting process⁴². Linking all relevant agencies has significant advantages as it eliminates the need to submit the same information to multiple public actors, reducing the time for the firm to obtain all the relevant information from each agency. Having an integrated Geographic Information System (GIS) can enable building departments and related agencies to streamline and automate their procedures for planning, zoning, and issuing building permits. This set of indicators assesses the exchange of information across agencies, such as municipalities, cadasters, land registries, utility service providers, fire safety agency, etc. Specifically, it assesses whether and how institutional information systems are interlinked to exchange information automatically. Therefore, Subcategory 2.2.2–Interoperability of Building Permits has two indicators (table 21).

Table 21. Subcategory 2.2.2–Interoperability for Building Permits

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Availability of spatial plans and zoning requirements to all stakeholders | Availability of spatial plans and zoning requirements to all stakeholders from the central information data source/digital platform such as GIS or national spatial planning platform |
| 2 | Integration of GIS or national spatial platforms | Integration of GIS or national spatial platforms between the permit-issuing agency and other stakeholder agencies |

Note: GIS = Geographic Information System.

2.3 Transparency of Information

Category 2.3 has four subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, consist of several components.

2.3.1 Transparency of Information for Immovable Property

One of the key elements of a good land administration system is transparency as it eliminates asymmetry of information between users and the administration. Transparency in land administration is essential for good governance and economic development, and the adoption of open data policies and make land ownership information easily accessible to the public.⁴³ When all land-related information is publicly available, all fees for public services are easily accessible, this minimizes the possibilities of informal payments. Therefore, Subcategory 2.3.1–Transparency of Information for Immovable Property has eight indicators (table 22).

Table 22. Subcategory 2.3.1. Transparency of Information for Immovable Property

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Publication of property transactions requirements | Publication of property transactions requirements |
| 2 | Transparency of property transactions costs | Transparency of property transactions costs |
| 3 | Service standards at the land registry | Service standards at the land registry |
| 4 | Transparency of cadaster costs | Transparency of cadaster costs |
| 5 | Service standards at the cadaster | Service standards for cadaster |
| 6 | Availability of statistics on land transactions | Official updated statistics tracking the number and the type of transactions at the immovable property registration agency over the past five years publicly available online: i) Statistics are available for the past 5 years ii) Statistics are available for the past 4 years iii) Statistics are available for the past 3 years iv) Statistics are available for the past 2 years v) Statistics are available for 1 year only |
| 7 | Availability of statistics on number and type of land disputes | Official updated statistics tracking the number and type of land disputes over the past five years publicly available online i) Statistics are available for the past 5 years ii) Statistics are available for the past 4 years iii) Statistics are available for the past 3 years iv) Statistics are available for the past 2 years v) Statistics are available for 1 year only |
| 8 | Availability of statistics on the average time to resolve land disputes | Official updated statistics tracking the average time taken to resolve land disputes over the past five years publicly available online i) Statistics are available for the past 5 years ii) Statistics are available for the past 4 years iii) Statistics are available for the past 3 years iv) Statistics are available for the past 2 years v) Statistics are available for 1 year only |

2.3.2 Gender Data on Property Ownership

Equal access to property rights is important to increase women's influence in land management and integrate women more into the workforce. Increasing women's access to land tenure promotes economic development. Further, such data can help reveal gender disparities in land ownership and control, and to identify opportunities for policy interventions to promote women's land rights as well help monitor progress towards gender equality in land governance.⁴⁴ These data can also help increase women's access to credit, improve their ability to invest in land-based activities, and enhance their participation in decision-making about land use and management.⁴⁵ Therefore, Subcategory 2.3.2–Gender Data on Property Ownership has one indicator on public availability of sex-disaggregated data at the immovable property (table 23).

Table 23. Subcategory 2.3.2-Gender Data on Property Ownership

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | Availability of statistics sex-disaggregated data on property ownership | Gender data on property ownership |

2.3.3 Transparency of Information for Building Permits and Environmental Licenses

Transparency in building permit systems is essential for promoting fair competition, ensuring compliance with safety and environmental regulations, facilitating the use of new technologies, improving the efficiency and effectiveness of the permitting process, and promoting economic growth and development.⁴⁶ This subcategory assesses the degree of transparency and accessibility of the building permitting agencies. For instance, it measures whether the permit-issuing agency provides public access to reliable, up-to-date information on the requirements to obtain building-related permits. In addition, it assesses whether the relevant regulations and requirements related to environmental licenses and clearances—as well as building energy codes—are publicly available. Therefore, Subcategory 2.3.3–Transparency of Information for Building Permits and Environmental Licenses has eight indicators (table 24).

Table 24. Subcategory 2.3.3—Transparency of Information for Building Permits and Environmental Licenses

| Litt | censes | | | | |
|------|---|---|--|--|--|
| | Indicators | Components | | | |
| 1 | Public accessibility of planning and building control regulations | Public accessibility of planning and building control regulations | | | |
| 2 | Public online availability of requirements to obtain all types of building related permits | i) Pre-approvals are provided ii) All requirements to submit building permit are available | | | |
| 3 | Public online availability of requirements needed to obtain occupancy permit | Public online availability of requirements needed to obtain occupancy permit | | | |
| 4 | Applicable fee schedules for all types of construction publicly available and up to date | Applicable fee schedules for all types of construction publicly available and up to date | | | |
| 5 | Public online availability of requirements to obtain environmental licensing for constructing a building with a moderate environmental risk | Public online availability of requirements to obtain environmental licensing for constructing a building with a moderate environmental risk | | | |
| 6 | Applicable fee schedule for obtaining any type of environmental clearances available and up to date | i) Available online and updated ii) Available online but not updated iii) Not available online iv) Available in paper format | | | |
| 7 | Availability of official, updated and publicly available online statistics tracking the number of issued building permits | i) Statistics are available for the past 5 years ii) Statistics are available for the past 4 years iii) Statistics are available for the past 3 years iv) Statistics are available for the past 2 years v) Statistics are available for 1 year only | | | |

| 8 | Availability of official, updated and publicly available online statistics tracking the number of EIAs | i) Statistics are available for the past 5 years ii) Statistics are available for the past 4 years iii) Statistics are available for the past 3 years iv) Statistics are available for the past 2 years v) Statistics are available for 1 year only |
|---|---|---|
|---|---|---|

2.3.4 Transparency of Information on Zoning and Land Use

Transparency of information for zoning and land use is important to promote accountability among government officials and decision-makers, reduces corruption on decision-making and increases certainty for businesses, developers and residents about the rules and regulations governing land use. This can reduce uncertainty and ambiguity, making it easier for these parties to make long-term plans and investments.⁴⁷ Therefore, Subcategory 2.3.4–Transparency of Information on Zoning and Land Use has three indicators (table 25).

Table 25. Subcategory 2.3.4—Transparency of Information on Zoning and Land Use

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|--------------------------------------|---|
| 1 | Updated city master plan/zoning plan | Updated city master plan/zoning plan |
| 2 | Steps to modify zoning/land use plan | Steps to modify zoning/land use plan |
| 3 | Adherence to zoning regulations | i) Through zoning maps of city accessible to builder online to verify that the project's intended location in in compliance with zoning regulations ii) Permit issuing authority checks the zoning compliance after receiving building permit application with no involvement from builder iii) Builder obtains urban planning approval from planning agency before obtaining building permit |

3. PILLAR III. EFFICIENCY: EFFICIENCY OF OBTAINING A BUSINESS LOCATION

Table 26 shows the structure for Pillar III, the Efficiency of Obtaining a Business Location. Each of this pillar's categories and subcategories will be discussed in more detail in the order shown in the table.

Table 26. Pillar III–Efficiency of Obtaining a Business Location

| 3.1 | Time to Obtain a Business Location | | |
|-------|---|--|--|
| 3.1.1 | Time to transfer property | | |
| 3.1.2 | Time to obtain a building permit | | |
| 3.1.3 | Time to obtain an occupancy permit | | |
| 3.1.4 | Time to obtain environmental clearances in construction | | |
| 3.2 | Cost to Obtain a Business Location | | |
| 3.2.1 | Cost to transfer property | | |
| 3.2.2 | Cost to obtain a building permit | | |
| 3.2.3 | Cost to obtain an occupancy permit | | |
| 3.2.4 | Cost to obtain an environmental clearance | | |

3.1 Time to Obtain a Business Location

Category 3.1 has four subcategories consisting of one indicator each.

3.1.1. Time to Transfer Property

The time taken to obtain property transfer varies from country to country and can depend on various factors such as the complexity of the property transaction, the efficiency of the legal system, and the availability of resources such as surveyors, appraisers, and land registry offices. The timeliness in which a change of ownership is processed is important for businesses as this can lead to delays in starting their business. Having an efficient conveyancing system in place, where bottlenecks are assessed on a regular basis, is

important to avoid delays in property transactions.⁴⁸ Therefore, Subcategory 3.1.1–Time to Transfer Property has one indicator on the Time to Transfer Property (table 27).

Table 27. Subcategory 3.1.1–Time to Transfer Property

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---------------------------|---|
| 1 | Time to Transfer Property | the period in days between the completed and submitted application and the final transfer |
| 1 | | of property title |

3.1.2. Time to Obtain a Building Permit

There can be significant variation in the time required to obtain permits and this depends on numerous factors such as existing backlogs of applications to be processed, scarce resources to process these applications or excessive requirements to submit these applications (such as too many required inspections). ⁴⁹ Tackling this issue is important as more efficient processing of building permits can have positive impact on economic growth and development, by increasing investment and employment opportunities. Therefore, Subcategory 3.1.2–Time to Obtain a Building Permit has one indicator on the Time to Obtain a Building Permit (table 28).

Table 28. Subcategory 3.1.2–Time to Obtain a Building Permit

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---------------------------|--|
| 1 | Time to Obtain a Building | The period in days between the completed and submitted application and obtaining |
| 1 | Permit | building permit |

3.1.3 Time to Obtain an Occupancy Permit

Delays in occupancy permit issuance can have negative impacts on project timelines and cost performance, highlighting the importance of efficient and effective permit processes The efficiency of occupancy permit processes can be affected by a range of factors, including regulatory environments, information technology systems, stakeholder collaboration, and capacity constraints. Improving efficiency in permit processes may have benefits for a range of stakeholders, including developers, municipalities, and citizens, by reducing costs and wait times, improving transparency, and enabling economic growth. Therefore, Subcategory 3.1.3–Time to Obtain an Occupancy Permit has one indicator on the Time to Obtain an Occupancy Permit (table 29).

Table 29. Subcategory 3.1.3-Time to Obtain an Occupancy Permit

| | Indicators | | | Components | |
|---|------------------|----|--------|------------|--|
| 1 | Time | to | Obtain | an | The period in days between the completed and submitted application and obtaining |
| 1 | Occupancy Permit | | | | occupancy permit |

3.1.4 Time to Obtain Environmental Clearances in Construction

Establishing clear and transparent environmental clearance procedures can help reduce the time to obtain environmental clearances, which is essential for promoting sustainable development.⁵¹ Delays in environmental clearances can significantly increase project costs and result in economic losses. Therefore, Subcategory 3.1.4–Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit in Construction has one indicator on the Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit in Construction (table 30).

Table 30. Subcategory 3.1.4—Time to Obtain Environmental Clearances in Construction

| | Indicators | | Components |
|---|---|--------------------|---|
| 1 | Time to Environmental Cle in Construction | Obtain earances | the period in days between the time to submit the application and the time to obtain the environmental clearances |

3.2 Cost to Obtain a Business Location

Category 3.2 has four subcategories consisting of one indicator each.

3.2.1. Cost to Transfer Property

Cumbersome processes and high fees, such as transfer tax, registration fees or stamp duties can discourage people from registering the transfer of property. It can also lead to reduced revenue collected by government from property taxation if high cost discourages property registration. Reducing the cost of transferring property ownership is essential for promoting transparency, competition, and innovation and for reducing corruption. Subcategory 3.2.1—Cost to Transfer Property has one indicator on the Cost to Transfer Property (table 31).

Table 31. Subcategory 3.2.1–Cost to Transfer Property

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|---------------------------|--|
| | | Includes all costs incurred by the firm to transfer ownership of a property from a buyer to |
| 1 | Cost to Transfer Property | a seller, including fees, transfer taxes, stamp duties and any other payment to the property |
| | | registry, notaries, public agencies, or lawyers |

3.2.2. Cost to Obtain a Building Permit

Lowering the cost of building permits can have significant positive impacts on the construction industry and the broader economy. By reducing the financial burden of obtaining permits, more construction projects can be initiated and completed, leading to increased job opportunities and economic growth. Additionally, lower permit costs can encourage the development of affordable housing and other infrastructure projects that benefit communities, including helping firms choose an appropriate location for their business operations. Therefore, Subcategory 3.2.2—Cost to Obtain a Building Permit has one indicator on the Cost to Obtain a Building Permit (table 32).

Table 32. Subcategory 3.2.2-Cost to Obtain a Building Permit

| - | | | |
|---|---|---------------------------|--|
| I | | Indicators | Components |
| ſ | 1 | Cost to Obtain a Building | Includes all costs incurred by the firm to obtain a building permit, including obtaining any |
| | 1 | Permit | required land use approvals and preconstruction design clearances, building permit fees |

3.2.3 Cost to Obtain an Occupancy Permit

Lowering the cost of occupancy permits can have significant benefits for small businesses and entrepreneurs. These permits are required by many local governments to certify that a building is safe and suitable for occupancy. However, high costs to obtain such permits can create a significant financial burden for small businesses. Therefore, Subcategory 3.2.3—Cost to Obtain an Occupancy Permit has one indicator on the Cost to Obtain an Occupancy Permit (table 33).

Table 33. Subcategory 3.2.3—Cost to Obtain an Occupancy Permit

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|------------------------------------|---|
| 1 | Cost to Obtain an Occupancy Permit | Includes all costs incurred by the firm to obtain an occupancy permit once all construction has been completed. The costs include occupancy permit fees, and any necessary fees for inspections |

3.4.2 Cost to Obtain Environmental Clearances in Construction

High cost of environmental permitting can have a significant impact on the economy and on businesses, impacting project feasibility and investment decisions. In addition, high permitting costs can discourage investment in environmental innovation, as well as making it more difficult for businesses to invest in and adopt new environmental technologies. Therefore, Subcategory 3.2.4—Cost to Obtain Environmental Clearances in Construction has one indicator on the Cost to Obtain Environmental Clearances in Construction (table 34).

Table 34. Subcategory 3.4.2-Cost to Obtain Environmental Clearances in Construction

| | Indicators | Components |
|---|--------------------------|---|
| | Cost to Obtain | |
| 1 | Environmental Clearances | includes all costs incurred by the firm to obtain the environmental clearance |
| | in Construction | · |

III. DATA SOURCES

4.1 Data collection sources

The data for Pillar I and Pillar II are collected through consultations with private and public sector experts. Private sector experts include lawyers and practitioners working in the area of property transfer, building permitting and environmental permitting.

The data for Pillar III are collected through consultation with private sector experts and Enterprise Surveys. Enterprise Surveys provide representative data on time and cost to obtain occupancy permits, as experienced by businesses in practice. A representative sample of companies captures variation of user experience within each economy. Businesses with different characteristics, such as size, region, and sector participate in the surveys. For more details on the collection of data by the Enterprise Surveys, please refer to the Overview chapter of this Methodology Handbook. Data on time and cost to transfer property, building permits and environmental clearances are collected through consultation with private sector experts, and broad parameters are defined (described in the section above) to ensure data comparability across economies. Private sector experts include property lawyers, notaries, conveyancers, architects, engineers, environmental consultants, environmental engineers, and environmental planners.

4.2 Screening and selection of experts

The Business Location topic has three questionnaires, one for each topic: Property Transfer, Building Permits, and Environmental Permits. Each questionnaire targets experts in their respective areas of expertise. A screener questionnaire is used to assist the selection of experts to participate in the Business Location questionnaire based on a set of criteria (table 35). The information provided in the screener questionnaires allows the team to better understand the experts' professions, areas of specialization, and knowledge or experience related to property transfer, building permitting and environmental permitting. Ultimately, this will allow the Team to select the experts to respond to the questionnaire on each of the topics (Property Transfer, Building Permits, and Environment Permits).

Table 35. Screener questionnaire and respondent criteria

| able 55. Servener questionnaire and respondent eriteria | | | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| Relevant expert professions | | | | | | |
| Property transfer | Property lawyers, notaries, conveyancers | | | | | |
| Building permitting | Architects, engineers, construction lawyers | | | | | |
| Environmental permitting | Environmental consultants, environmental engineers and environmental planners | | | | | |
| Relevant areas of specialization | on . | | | | | |
| Property transfer | Property law, notarial services, conveyancing | | | | | |
| Building permitting | Architecture, civil engineering, construction contracting, construction law | | | | | |
| Environmental permitting | Environmental law, environmental engineering, environmental planning | | | | | |
| Assessment of the experts' | knowledge and experience related to property transfer, building permitting and | | | | | |
| environmental permitting an | d related regulations, services, and processes | | | | | |
| Property transfer | Experience with preparing contracts of purchase and sale of property, conducting commercial | | | | | |
| | property transactions, conducting property registrations at land registry/deed registry, | | | | | |
| | contacting tax authorities for property transaction related taxes (transfer tax, stamp duty, etc.); | | | | | |
| | engagement with complaint mechanisms for property transfer services; as well as knowledge | | | | | |
| | of the regulations affecting property transfer | | | | | |

| Building permitting | Experience with obtaining all necessary pre-approvals and submitting applications for building permits with the building control agency or municipality; awareness of building code provisions, building permitting fees; engagement; and knowledge of the regulations affecting building control. |
|--------------------------|--|
| Environmental permitting | Experience with obtaining environmental clearances and permits related new construction projects, preparing and submitting Environmental Impact Assessments, awareness of environmental laws and regulations, awareness of complaint mechanisms for environmental permitting. |

IV. PARAMETERS

To ensure comparability of the data from expert consultations across economies, the Business Location topic uses general as well as specific parameters. A parameter refers to an assumption that is made about the characteristics of a location, the type and size of a construction project and the value of a property.

5.1 General parameters

Property transfer, building permitting, and environmental permitting share a common general parameter of location. Many economies have subnational jurisdictions (such as the state level), which requires a specific business location to be specified in order for experts to identify the relevant regulatory framework to be assessed.

5.1.1. Business location—Largest city

Justification:

Geographic location determines the relevant regulatory framework governing building and environmental permits. In many economies, legislation governing building and environmental permits is defined at city and municipal level. For property transfer, building permits and environmental permits, geographical location determines which municipality, agency or registry provides the permitting services. Some restrictions might be imposed on construction and on property ownership and leasehold (both for domestic and foreign firms) depending on location. Environmental clearances are also affected by the location of the property being developed. Thus, business location is an essential parameter for assessing efficiency of obtaining a business location. The largest city is chosen based on the population size, as detailed in the Overview chapter of this Methodology Handbook.

Application:

For Pillar I, the parameter is used in cases where regulations are not applicable at national level but vary across states or regions. For the economies where regulations differ across states, regulations for the largest city (by population) are measured. For Pillar II, the parameter is used to determine the relevant municipality involved in providing building permitting services and the relevant agency involved in providing environmental clearances for construction projects. For Pillar III, this parameter applies to data collected through expert consultations rather than through enterprise surveys. Specifically, the parameter is relevant for measures on time and cost as they can vary significantly across cities.

5.2 Specific parameters

Some specific parameters are also necessary to ensure that estimates provided by experts with regard to the transfer of property, to obtaining building-related permits or environmental permits in construction, are comparable across economies. Obtaining such estimates can vary widely depending on the value of property (for transfer of property); type and size of building (for building permits); type and size of housing development (for environmental permits).

5.2.1 Value of property

Justification:

For property transfer and building permits, a specific parameter of the value of property or construction cost is used to be able to compute time and cost indicators. The value of the property or the construction cost is required to calculate transfer tax, registration fees, and stamp duties in several jurisdictions.⁵⁷ For example, in South Africa the amount of transfer duty paid is based on the value of the property being transferred and is calculated using a sliding scale of property tax. In Ghana, the amount of stamp duty paid is based on the value of the property being transferred and is calculated using a fixed rate.

Building permit fees are often based on the value of the construction project. In many cases, the fees are calculated as a percentage of the estimated construction costs. Knowing the value of the property allows the building department to accurately assess the estimated cost of the construction project and apply the appropriate fee.⁵⁸ Considering the example of Australia, building permit fees are based on the value of the construction project: in Sydney, the Building and Development Advisory Service provides a fee calculator tool that allows users to estimate the cost of building permit fees based on the value of the construction project. Put simply, the rationale behind setting a value of property is to ensure data comparability across all surveyed economies.

Application:

Pillar III of the Business Location topic assumes the value of property or construction cost to be 100 times gross national income (GNI) per capita. This value will be provided as an equivalent in local currency of each economy. In the absence of reliable data on property or construction values across all economies, GNI per capita multiplied by 100 is suggested to approximate these values based on respective affordability rates.

5.2.2 Largest municipality

Justification:

In some cities, there could be one or several municipalities. The Business Location topic, and building permitting in particular, aim to capture the most common practice; hence, the largest municipality in the largest city is considered (in terms of customers served or market share).

Application:

The parameter of the largest municipality in the largest city is relevant to all measures of Pillar II and Pillar III for building permitting because provision of building permits varies depending on the municipality. For Pillar III, the parameter applies to measures on time and cost as efficiency of obtaining a building permit may vary depending on the municipality.

5.2.3 Type and size of building

Justification:

To make the data comparable across economies for building permitting, the type and size of building are used as a unit of measurement. Building regulations vary depending on the type of construction being permitted—typically classified as residential, commercial, or industrial. The type and level of pre-approvals and the type of documents to be submitted, as well as the associated regulatory costs, vary with type of construction (for example, residential buildings usually require fewer technical plans, documents, fewer pre-approvals, and lower fees). Regulatory aspects, like technical inspections mandated by law, are also usually governed by the type of construction in question. The size of building affects the cost of permitting. In some cases, it can affect the number of inspections to be conducted during construction, which is often calculated as a fixed fee per square meter/foot or cubic meter. For example, in Singapore, Thailand, and the United Kingdom, fees to obtain building and occupancy permits are based on a fixed fee per square meter/foot or cubic meter. In Jordan, the fees for building permits are calculated based on the number of

floors. The size of the building can also affect the fees in property transactions. For example, in Albania local fees are calculated based on the size of the building.

Application:

Pillar III of the Business Location topic provides specific parameters about the type of building being considered, and its size, and height for the purposes of comparison:

- Type of building: commercial building—in particular, an office building
- Size of commercial building: 1800 square meters (19,375 square feet)⁵⁹
 - Computed assuming 5 floors and 360 square meters per floor (3875 square feet)
- Building height: 5 floors, with each floor assumed to be 3 meters (9 ft and 10 inches) high

5.2.4 Type of development and surface area of development

Justification:

Environmental clearances and permits requirements vary depending on size and location of the project, as well as its potential impact on the environment. Establishing clear and transparent criteria for triggering environmental clearances can help to ensure that all relevant projects are subject to the same scrutiny and can increase public trust and confidence in the clearance process. ⁶⁰ For example, the environmental impact assessment and audit regulations in Tanzania require an environmental impact assessment study to be conducted for projects that are above certain sizes and include housing developments. The threshold for when an EIA is required in Tanzania for housing developments is more than 50 housing units or more than 2 hectares of land. ⁶¹

The size and type of a project can lead to increased stormwater runoff, changes to the hydrology of nearby water bodies, or potential contamination of groundwater resources. Many jurisdictions therefore require developers to obtain permits or approvals related to water quality and management as part of the environmental review process for new construction projects.⁶² In addition, construction projects may have an adverse impact on water resources, particularly in areas with high planned residential density, highlighting the need for effective environmental permitting requirements to protect water quality in these areas.

Application:

Pillar I and Pillar III of the Business Location topic provide for specific parameters for the construction of a housing development project:

- Total surface area of residential housing development project: 10 acres (40,468 sqm)
- Type of residence: Detached single family house with 1, 2 and 3 bedrooms, each with its own driveway
- Estimated number of houses: 100 single family homes
- Estimated number of residents in the housing project: 63 600

V. TOPIC SCORING

The Business Location topic has three pillars: Pillar I—Quality of Regulations for Immovable Property Transfer, Urban planning and Environmental Permitting; Pillar II—Quality of Public Services and Transparency of Information, and Pillar III—Efficiency of Obtaining a Business Location. The total points for each pillar are further rescaled to values from 0 to 100, and subsequently aggregated into the total topic score. Each pillar contributes one-third to the total topic score. Table 36 shows the scoring for the Business Location topic. The scores distinguish between benefits to the firm (captured as firm flexibility points) and benefits to society's broader interests (captured as social benefits points). For further scoring details, please see Annex A, which complements this section.

Table 36. Aggregate scoring overview

| | | Number | Score | | Rescaled | | |
|--------|---|------------------|---------------------|--------------------|--------------|-------------------|--------|
| Pillar | Title | of indicators | Firm flexibility | Social benefits | Total points | points (0-100) | Weight |
| I | Quality of Regulations for Immovable Property Transfer, Urban planning and Environmental Permitting | 62 | 47 | 43 | 90 | 100 | 0.33 |
| II | Quality and transparency of public services | 46 | 46 | 46 | 92 | 100 | 0.33 |
| III | Efficiency of obtaining a business location in practice | 8 | 100 | n.a. | 100 | 100 | 0.33 |

Note: n.a. = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent).

6.1 Pillar I-Regulatory Framework: Quality of Regulations for Immoveable Property Transfer, Urban Planning, and Environmental Permitting

Pillar I covers 62 indicators with a total score of 90 points (47 points on firm flexibility and 43 points on social benefits). The scoring for each category under this pillar is as follows:

- 6.1.1 <u>Regulatory Standards for Land Administration</u> has 11 indicators with a total maximum score of 22 points (11 points on firm flexibility and 11 points on social benefits) (table 37). Specifically, this category has three subcategories. The *Property Transaction Standards* Subcategory has 4 indicators. The *Land Dispute Resolution Mechanisms* Subcategory has 4 indicators. The *Land Administration System* Subcategory has 3 indicators. A regulatory framework that ensures efficiency of land administration systems, and effective dispute resolution mechanisms benefits both firms (firm flexibility) and society/customers (social benefits). Hence, equal scores are assigned to both categories.
- 6.1.2 <u>Restrictions on Property Lease and Ownership</u> covers 19 indicators with a total maximum score of 19 points (19 points on firm flexibility and 0 on social benefits) (table 37). Specifically, this category has 4 subcategories: the *Restrictions on Domestic Firms to Lease Property Subcategory* has 5 indicators; the *Restrictions on Domestic Firms to Own Property* Subcategory has 4 indicators; the *Restrictions on Foreign Firms to Lease Property* Subcategory has 5 indicators; and the *Restrictions on Foreign Firms to Own Property* has 5 indicators. A regulatory framework that imposes restrictions on lease or ownership of property can create obstacles to developing a business. Therefore, it is important to eliminate such barriers to promote flexible environment for firms (firm flexibility). On the other hand, the short-term impact of such restriction on society is ambiguous (social benefits). Hence, score is only assigned to firm flexibility.
- **6.1.3** <u>Gender covers 1</u> indicator with a total maximum score of 2 points (1 point on firm flexibility and 1 point on social benefit) (table 37). Specifically, this category covers *Gender Incentives for Professional Participation* to promote the presence of women in business location related professions.
- 6.1.4 Regulatory Standards for Building Regulations and Environmental Licenses covers 31 indicators with a total maximum score of 47 points (16 points on firm flexibility and 31 points on social benefits) (table 37). Specifically, the Building Regulations Standards Subcategory has 13 indicators; the Building Energy Code and Standards Subcategory has 4 indicators; the Zoning and Land Use Planning Subcategory has 1 indicator; the Environmental Clearances in Construction Subcategory has 10 indicators; and the Dispute Mechanisms for Building Permits and Environmental Clearances in Construction Subcategory has 2 indicators. The positive impact for society is derived from enhanced environmental sustainability and improved adherence to

environmental standards. Some measures under this category have either a neutral impact on firms, or an ambiguous impact and hence are not scored.

| Pillar I–Quality of Regulations for Immovable Property Transfer, Urban Planning, and Environmental Permitting | | No. of indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | Rescaled points |
|---|--|----------------------|------|------|---------------------|-----------------|
| 1.1 | Regulatory Standards for Land Administration | 11 | 11 | 11 | 22 | 24.2 |
| 1.1.1 | Property Transactions Standards | 4 | 4 | 4 | 8 | 8.8 |
| 1.1.2 | Land Dispute Mechanism | 4 | 4 | 4 | 8 | 8.8 |
| 1.1.3 | Land Administration System | 3 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 6.6 |
| 1.2 | Restrictions on Property Lease and Ownership | 19 | 19 | n.a. | 19 | 20.9 |
| 1.2.1 | Restriction on domestic firms to lease property- | 5 | 5 | n.a. | 5 | 5.5 |
| 1.2.2 | Restrictions on domestic firms to own property | 4 | 4 | n.a. | 4 | 4.4 |
| 1.2.3 | Restrictions of foreign firms to lease property | 5 | 5 | n.a. | 5 | 5.5 |
| 1.2.4 | Restrictions on foreign firms to own property | 5 | 5 | n.a. | 5 | 5.5 |
| 1.3 | Gender | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.2 |
| 1.3.1 | Gender Incentives for Professional Participation | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.2 |
| 1.4 | Regulatory Standards for Building Regulations and Environmental Licenses | 31 | 16 | 31 | 47 | 52.2 |
| 1.4.1 | Building Regulations Standards | 13 | 9 | 13 | 22 | 24.2 |
| 1.4.2 | Building Energy Codes and Standards | 4 | n.a. | 4 | 4 | 4.4 |
| 1.4.3 | Zoning and Land Use Planning | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.2 |
| 1.4.4 | Environmental Clearances in Construction | 10 | 3 | 10 | 13 | 14.4 |
| 1.4.5 | Dispute Mechanisms for Building Permits and Environmental Clearances in Construction | 3 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 6.6 |
| | Total | 62 | 47 | 43 | 90 | 100 |

Note: n.a. = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = firm flexibility points; SBF = social benefits points.

6.2 Pillar II–Public Services: Quality of Public Services and Transparency of Information

Pillar II includes 46 indicators with a total score of 92 points (46 points on firm flexibility and 46 points on social benefits). The scoring for each category under the pillar is as follows:

- 6.2.1 Availability of Online Services and reliability of infrastructure covers 20 indicators with a total maximum score of 40 points (20 points on firm flexibility and 20 points on social benefits) (table 38). Specifically, the Property Transactions—Digital Public Services Subcategory has 6 indicators; the Property Transactions-Reliability of Infrastructure Subcategory has 5 indicators; the Property Transactions-Coverage Subcategory has 4 indicators; and the Building Permits and Environmental Licenses-Digital Public Services Subcategory has 5 indicators. Under this category, the score is allocated equally between firm flexibility and social benefits. Availability of online services for property transactions, building permitting and environmental permitting increases efficiency and supports public accountability, therefore extending benefits to firms and society as a whole.
- 6.2.2 <u>Interoperability of Services</u> covers 6 indicators with a total maximum score of 12 points (6 points on firm flexibility and 6 points on social benefits) (table 38). Specifically, the <u>Interoperability of Services for Property Transactions</u> Subcategory has 4 indicators: and the <u>Interoperability of Services for Building Permits</u> Subcategory has 2 indicators. A regulatory framework that promotes the integration and compatibility of different systems and services related land administration and building control services provides for greater transparency and efficiency of services and benefits both firms (firm flexibility) and society (social benefits). Hence, equal scores are assigned to both categories.

6.2.3 <u>Transparency of Information</u> covers 20 indicators with a total maximum score of 40 points (20 points on firm flexibility and 20 on social benefits) (table 38). Specifically, the *Transparency of Information for Immovable Property* Subcategory has 8 points; the *Gender Data on Property Ownership* Subcategory has 1 indicator; the *Transparency of Information for Building Permits and Environmental Licenses* Subcategory has 8 indicators; and the *Transparency of Information on Zoning and Land Use* Subcategory has 3 indicators. A regulatory framework that ensures transparency of land administration, building control and environmental permitting services provides firms with clarity and predictability regarding the rules and regulations they need to comply with, which in turn allows them to operate with greater flexibility and adaptability. This can result in increased innovation, competitiveness, and profitability for businesses, which benefits both firms (firm flexibility) and society (social benefits). Hence, equal scores are assigned to both categories.

| | II–Public Services: Quality of Public Services | No. of | FFP | SBP | Total points | Rescaled |
|-------|--|------------|-----|-----|--------------|----------|
| . 1 | | indicators | | | | points |
| 2.1 | Availability and Reliability of Online Services | 20 | 20 | 20 | 40 | 43.5 |
| 2.1.1 | Property Transactions-Digital Public Services | 6 | 6 | 6 | 12 | 13 |
| 2.1.2 | Property Transactions-Reliability of infrastructure | 5 | 5 | 5 | 10 | 10.9 |
| 2.1.3 | Property Transactions-Coverage | 4 | 4 | 4 | 8 | 8.7 |
| | Building Permits and Environmental Licenses- Digital Public Services | 5 | 5 | 5 | 10 | 10.9 |
| 2.2 | Interoperability of Services | 6 | 6 | 6 | 12 | 13 |
| 2.2.1 | Interoperability for property transactions | 4 | 4 | 4 | 8 | 8.7 |
| 2.2.2 | Interoperability for building permits | 2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4.4 |
| 2.3 | Transparency of Information | 20 | 20 | 20 | 40 | 43.9 |
| 2.3.1 | Transparency of information on immovable property | 8 | 8 | 8 | 16 | 17.4 |
| 2.3.2 | Gender data on property ownership | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.2 |
| 2.3.3 | Transparency of information for building permitting and environmental licenses | 8 | 8 | 8 | 16 | 17.4 |
| 2.3.4 | Transparency of information on zoning and land use | 3 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 6.1 |
| | Total | 46 | 46 | 46 | 92 | 100 |

Note: FFP = firm flexibility points; SBF = social benefits points.

6.3 Pillar III-Efficiency of Obtaining a Business Location

Pillar III has 8 indicators with scores ranging from 0 to 100 on firm flexibility. The scores on indicators under this pillar are assigned to firm flexibility only, as the indicators measure the outcomes of service provision to firms. For example, high fees and long times to transfer a property or to obtain building and environmental permits have adverse impacts on firms, thus reducing the firm flexibility score.

| Pillar I | II-Efficiency of Obtaining a Business Location | No. of indicators | Rescaled points |
|----------|--|-------------------|-----------------|
| 3.1 | Time to Obtain a Business Location | 4 | 50 |
| 3.1.1 | Time to transfer property | 1 | 12.5 |
| 3.1.2 | Time to obtain a building permit | 1 | 12.5 |
| 3.1.3 | Time to obtain an occupancy permit | 1 | 12.5 |
| 3.1.4 | Time to obtain an environmental clearance | 1 | 12.5 |
| 3.2 | Cost to Obtain a Business Location | 4 | 50 |
| 3.2.1 | Cost to transfer property | 1 | 12.5 |
| 3.2.2 | Cost to obtain a building permit | 1 | 12.5 |
| 3.2.3 | Cost to obtain an occupancy permit | 1 | 12.5 |
| 3.2.4 | Cost to obtain an environmental clearance | 1 | 12.5 |
| | Total | 8 | 100 |

Note: FFP = firm flexibility points; SBF = social benefits points.

References

- Adenuga, A. H., C. Jack, and R. McCarry. 2021. "The Case for Long-Term Land Leasing: A Review of the Empirical Literature." *Land* 10 (3): 1–21.
- Amadi-Echendu, A. P., and R. Pellissier. 2014. "Eliminating Bottlenecks in the South African Conveyancing Environment." *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* 5 (5). doi:10.5901/mjss. 2014.v5n14p97.
- Anhuforom, A. A., and A. T. Awoyemi. 2016. "Environmental Impact Assessment in Africa: Progress, Prospects and Challenges." *Journal of Environmental Management* 183: 448–60. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2016.08.068.
- Babatunde, O. T., R. O. Yusuf, and E. B. Ogunbode. 2016. "Planning for Infrastructure Service Access in Nigerian Cities: An Overview of Policy and Practice." *Habitat International* 53: 156–66.
- Bennison, D. J. 2006. "Developing Effective Property Transaction Standards." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 24 (3): 216–35.
- Boonyabancha, S., R. Singhadej, and S. Dhanapal. 2017. "A GIS-based Approach to Land Use Planning for Hazardous Facilities: A Case Study of Rayong Province, Thailand." *Habitat International* 62: 61–70.
- Carlson, V. 2000. "Studying Firm Locations: Survey Responses vs. Econometric Models." *Journal of Regional Analysis and Policy* 30 (1): 1–22.
- Charalambous, E., E. Cimren, and S. Bano. 2018. "Digitalisation of Building Permitting Procedures in EU Cities." European Parliament.
- Dasgupta, P., and A. Singh. 2006. "Ownership Structure, Corporate Governance, and Firm Performance: Evidence from India." *Journal of Corporate Finance* 12 (4): 645–59.
- Davis, R., and T. Barlow. 2017. "Key Elements of Effective Zoning Regulations." *Journal of the American Planning Association* 83 (3): 236–48.
- Deininger, K. and G. Feder. 1996. "Property Registration and Title Systems in Developing Countries." Policy Research Working Paper 1610. World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Deininger, K., and G. Feder. 2009. "Land Registration, Governance, and Development: Evidence and Implications for Policy." World Bank Research Observer 24 (2).
- Deininger, K., and H. Selod. 2012. "Strengthening Land Governance: Lessons Learned and Best Practices from Country Experiences." *World Bank Research Observer* 27 (2): 142–67.
- De Soto, H. 2000. The Mystery of Capital: Why Capitalism Triumphs in the West and Fails Everywhere Else. New York: Basic Books.
- FAO (Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations). 2013. "Women's Land Rights as a Pathway to Poverty Reduction: A Framework and Review of Available Evidence." FAO, Rome.

- Field, E. 2007. "Entitled to Work: Urban Property Rights and Labor Supply in Peru." *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 122 (4): 1561–1602.
- Gao, X., H. Chen, Y. Li, X. Li, and X. Deng. 2020. "Property Risk Identification Based on Machine Learning Algorithm in Due Diligence Process." *International Journal of Computational Intelligence Systems* 13 (1): 387–97.
- Garrido, A., D. Tapia, and C. Vergara. 2019. "Compliance with Energy Codes in Buildings: A Review of International Experiences and Insights for Latin America." *Energy and Buildings* 198: 221–32.
- Gathii, J. T. 2013. "Comparative Land Tenure and Property Rights Systems in Africa." *Journal of African Law* 57 (2): 221–40.
- Ghosh, Shibani. 2013. "Demystifying the Environmental Clearance Process in India." 6 NUJS Law Review 3: 433–80.
- Golub, S. 2003, "Measures of Restrictions on Inward Foreign Direct Investment for OECD Countries." OECD Economics Department Working Paper No. 357, OECD Publishing, Paris.
- Green, A., and C. Moser. 2013. "Do Property Rights Institutions Matter at the Local Level? Evidence from Madagascar." *Journal of Development Studies* 49 (1): 95–109.
- Grunwald, S., P. Bendt, and J. Kopfmüller. 2016. "Environmental Permits as an Instrument for Sustainable Planning and Decision Making in Infrastructure Projects." *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 60: 85–93.
- Gupta, M., and P. Bansal. 2014. "Environmental Impact Assessment of Construction Projects: A Comparative Analysis of the Legal Frameworks in India and the United States." *Journal of Environmental Management* 134: 57–66.
- Gupta, A., R. Dunning, and P. McAllister. 2020. "Online Conveyancing Portals in the UK: Benefits and Limitations." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 38 (3): 268–82.
- Halpern, P., and J. Lutz. 2014. "Land Leasing and Land Use Dynamics in Developing Country Cities." *Land Use Policy* 36: 330–37.
- Hodge, T. R., and M. Greve. 2017. "Zoning, Land Use Planning, and the Local Economy." *Journal of Planning Literature* 32 (1): 3–14.
- Haltom, R. A., and R. Tanimoto. 2017. "Gender and Performance in the US Real Estate Industry." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 35 (2): 154–71.
- IBA (International Bar Association). 2019. "Transparency in Land Ownership: A Guide to Good Practice." International Bar Association.
- IFC (International Finance Corporation), World Bank, and MIGA (Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency). 2013. *Good Practices for Construction Regulation and Enforcement Reform: Guidelines for Reformers*. Washington, DC: World Bank Group.
- ILC (International Land Coalition). 2017. "Improving Land Governance through Interoperability." Briefing Paper.

- https://www.landcoalition.org/sites/default/files/documents/resources/ILC_Interoperability_Briefing_Paper_2017_0.pdf.
- ILO (International Labour Organization. 2018. "Women in Construction: The State of the Evidence on Drivers, Impacts and Solutions." https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_ent/---ifp_seed/documents/publication/wcms_644392.pdf.
- Johnson, S., J. McMillan, and C. Woodruff. 2002. "Property Rights and Finance." *American Economic Review* 92 (5, December): 1335–56.
- Kuprenas, J. A., and G. E. Chalmers. 1999. "Occupancy Permit Issuance: A Comparative Study." *Journal of Construction Engineering and Management* 125 (4): 283–87.
- Lee, S., J. Lee, and K. Lee. 2014. "The Effects of Ownership and Capital Structure on Performance: Evidence from Korean Firms." *Asia-Pacific Journal of Financial Studies* 43 (2): 177–202.
- Liao, R., and D. Zhang. 2016. "Property Rights, Investment Incentives, and Foreign Direct Investment." Journal of Comparative Economics 44 (4): 1088–1104.
- Linnenberg, T., T. Gür, and T. Gür. 2020. "Digitalisation of Building Permits: Perspectives and Approaches from Selected European Countries." *Journal of European Real Estate Research* 13 (3): 247–63.
- Mitincu, C-G, I-C Ioja, C-A Hossu, M. Artmann, A. Nita, and Mi-R Nita. 2021. "Licensing Sustainability-related Aspects in Strategic Environmental Assessment. Evidence from Romania's Urban Areas." *Land Use Policy* 108 (2021): 105572.
- Moussa, I., and P. Li. 2020. "Building Permit Regulatory Burden Index: An Analysis of Building Permit Procedures and Associated Costs in US Municipalities." *Journal of Building Engineering* 29: 101157.
- NAHB (National Association of Home Builders). 2021. "Housing Affordability Is a Critical Issue." https://www.nahb.org/Advocacy/Housing-Affordability.
- NIST (National Institute of Standards and Technology). 2007. "Economic Impact of Property Rights: A Review of the Evidence. https://www.nist.gov/system/files/documents/itl/2007_economic_impact_property_rights.pdf.
- OECD (Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development). 2019. "Building Permit Transparency: Monitoring and Improving Permitting Systems." OECD.
- Ramanathan, R., M. Petersen, L. Srivastava, and K. Fahey. 2018. "Integrating Local Ecological Knowledge and Scientific Data to Inform Environmental Impact Assessments in Coastal Communities: Lessons from India." *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 73: 173–80.
- Rosenberg, M., J. Amann, H. Blum, and R. Sedano. 2014. "The Potential Impact of Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Policies on Electricity Markets and CO₂ Emissions of the US Building Sector." *Energy Policy* 73: 180–91.
- Ryan, C., and B. O'Regan. 2015. "Construction and the Environment: A Literature Review." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 109: 48–56.

- Sarris, A., D. Tzovaras, and C. Doukas. 2020. "Digital Transformation of the Building Permit Process: The Case of Greece." *Buildings* 10 (3): 52.
- Tan, R. M. K. 2004. "Restrictions on the Foreign Ownership of Property: Indonesia and Singapore Compared." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 22 (1): 101–11.
- Triana, E. Sanchez, L. Ortolano, G. Ruta, G. Dezfuli, and R. Kanakia. 2011. "Implementation of Environmental Policies." World Bank, Washington, DC.
- UNECE (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe). 2018a. "Transparency in Land Administration." UNECE.
- UNECE (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe). 2018b. "Real Estate Markets and Sustainable Development Goals: Challenges and Opportunities." UNECE.
- Urban Land Institute. 2015. "Myth and Fact: Higher-Density Development and the Future of Metropolitan Areas." https://uli.org/wp-content/uploads/ULI-Documents/HigherDensity_MythFact.ashx_.pdf.
- Van der Molen, P. 2007. "Some Measures to Improve Transparency in Land Administration" TS IA-Land Administration Concepts. http://www-.fig.net/resources/proceedings/fig_proceedings/fig2007/papers/ts_1a/ts01a_05_molen_1304.pdf.
- Wang, X., and W. Cen. 2016. "The Impact of Building Permit Approval Speed on Local Economy." *Journal of Real Estate Research* 38 (3): 365–88.
- Wang, Y., and L. Liu. 2015. "Environmental Impact Assessment and Construction Project Delays: Empirical Evidence from China." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 102: 362–69.
- Wehrmann, B. 2008. *Land Conflicts: A Practical Guide to Dealing with Land Disputes*. Eschborn, Germany: Deutche GTZ (Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit).
- Williamson, I. P. 2001. "Land Administration 'Best Practice' Providing the Infrastructure for Land Policy Implementation." *Land Use Policy* 18 (4): 297–307. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0264-8377(01)00021-7.
- World Bank. 2007. Environmental Assessment Sourcebook: Volume 1–Policies, Procedures, and Cross-Cutting Issues. http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTENVIRODEVEL/Resources/EAS_Vol1_all.pdf.
- World Bank. 2014. Gender and Land Tenure in Sub-Saharan Africa. Washington DC: World Bank.
- World Bank Group. No date (n.d.). Zoning and Land Use Planning. https://urban-regeneration.worldbank.org/node/39#:~:text=Why%20is%20zoning%20necessary%3F,down%20 development%20in%20specific%20areas.
- Zakout, W., B. Wehrmann, and M-P Törhönen. 2006. "Good Governance in Land Administration Principles and Good Practices." Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), Rome.

- ³ De Soto (2000); Johnson, McMillan, and Woodruff (2002).
- ⁴ Field (2007); Green and Moser (2013).
- ⁵ Deininger and Feder (2009).
- ⁶ Bennison (2006).
- ⁷ Gathii (2013).
- ⁸ Deininger and Feder (1996).
- ⁹ Wehrmann (2008).
- ¹⁰ Deininger and Selod (2012).
- ¹¹ Deininger and Feder (2009).)
- ¹² Zakout, Wehrmann, and Törhönen (2006).
- ¹³ Hodge and Greve (2017).
- ¹⁴ Halpern and Lutz (2014).
- ¹⁵ Dasgupta and Singh (2006).
- ¹⁶ Golub (2003).
- ¹⁷ Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014).
- ¹⁸ Tan. (2004).
- ¹⁹ Liao and Zhang (2016).
- ²⁰ Haltom and Tanimoto (2017).
- ²¹ ILO (2018).
- ²² IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013).
- ²³ Rosenberg et al. (2014).
- ²⁴ Garrido, Tapia, and Vergara. 2019.
- ²⁵ Babatunde, Yusuf, and Ogunbode (2016).
- ²⁶ Boonyabancha, Singhadei, and Dhanapal (2017).
- ²⁷ World Bank Group (n.d.).
- ²⁸ Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016).
- ²⁹ Gupta and Bansal (2014).
- ³⁰ Ryan and O'Regan (2015).
- ³¹ Wang and Liu (2015).
- ³² Sánchez-Triana et al. (2014).
- ³³ Ramanathan et al. (2018).
- ³⁴ Williamson (2001).
- ³⁵ Gao et al. (2020).
- ³⁶ Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020).
- ³⁷ Deininger and Feder (2009).
- ³⁸ Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020).
- ³⁹ Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018).
- ⁴⁰ NIST (2007).
- ⁴¹ ILC (2017).
- ⁴² Sarris, Tzovaras, and Doukas (2020).
- ⁴³ Van der Molen (2007).
- ⁴⁴ FAO (2013).
- ⁴⁵ World Bank (2014).
- ⁴⁶ OECD (2019).
- 47 Davis and Barlow (2017).
- ⁴⁸ Amadi-Echendu, Anthea, and Pellissier (2014).
- ⁴⁹ Moussa and Li (2020).
- ⁵⁰ Kuprenas and Chalmers (1999); NAHB (2021).

¹ Carlson (2000).

² Adenuga, Jack, and McCarry (2021).

⁵¹ Ghosh (2013).

- ⁵⁸ International Code Council, Building Valuation Data. https://www.iccsafe.org/products-and-services/ibc-related-products/building-valuation-data/).
- ⁵⁹ Several resources mention that the average office space per person lies between 150-250 square feet per person. See for example Aquila Commercial Guidelines: https://aquilacommercial.com/learning-center/how-much-office-space-need-calculator-per-person/. For other areas in an office, besides the office space, see Guidance Brokers size estimates:

https://www.guidancebrokers.com/resources/calculators/office-space/.

- ⁶⁰ World Bank (2007).
- ⁶¹ Anhuforom and Awoyemi (2016).
- ⁶² Mitincu et al. (2021).
- ⁶³ Urban Land Institute (2015).

⁵² IBA (2019).

⁵³ UNECE (2018b).

⁵⁴ Moussa and Li (2020); Wang and Cen (2016).

⁵⁵ Kuprenas and Chalmers (1999); NAHB (2021).

⁵⁶ Ghosh (2013).

⁵⁷ Investopedia, "Transfer Tax." https://www.investopedia.com/terms/t/transfertax.asp).

Annex A. Business Location-Scoring Sheet

This document outlines the scoring approach for the Business Location topic. For every indicator, a Firm Flexibility Point (FFP) and/or a Social Benefit Point (SBP) are assigned, along with a clarification on the detailed scoring for each such indicator and a note on the relevant background literature.

| PILLAR I–QUALITY OF REGULATIONS FOR IMMOVABLE PROPERTY TRANSFER, URBAN PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITTING | | | | | | | | |
|--|----------|---|---|------|---|--|--|--|
| 1.1 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR LAND ADMINISTRATION | | | | | | | | |
| 1.1.1 Property Transactions Standards | | | | | | | | |
| Indicators FFP SBP Total points Packground literature Background literature | | | | | | | | |
| Legal Obligation to Check Documents Compliance with the Law | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Bennison (2006); Deininger and Feder (2009) | | | |
| Legal Obligation to Verify Identities of the Parties | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Bennison (2006); Deininger and Feder (2009) | | | |
| Legal Obligation to Register Sales Transactions | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Bennison (2006); Deininger and Feder (2009) | | | |
| Legal Provision on the Legality of Online Documents | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Bennison (2006); Deininger and Feder (2009) | | | |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.1.1 | 4 | 4 | 8 | 8.80 | | | | |
| 1.1.2 Land Dispute Resolution Mechanisms | <u>'</u> | | | | | | | |
| Legal Provisions for Arbitration as an Alternative Land Disputes Resolution Mechanism | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Deininger and Feder (1996); Gathii (2013); Wehrmann (2008) | | | |
| Legal Provisions for Conciliation and Mediation as Alternative Land Disputes Resolution Mechanisms | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Deininger and Feder (1996); Gathii (2013); Wehrmann (2008) | | | |
| Legal Provisions to Provide Out of Court Compensation for Losses due to Erroneous Information from the Land Registry | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Deininger and Feder (1996); Gathii (2013); Wehrmann (2008) | | | |
| Legal Provision for Protection of Property Title | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Deininger and Feder (1996); Gathii (2013); Wehrmann (2008) | | | |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.1.2 | 4 | 4 | 8 | 8.80 | | | | |
| 1.1.3 Land Administration System | | | | | | | | |
| Disclosure of Land Registry Information | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Deininger and Fedor (2009); Deininger and Selod (2012); Zakout, Wehrmann, and Törhönen (2006) | | | |
| Disclosure of Cadastral Information | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Deininger and Fedor (2009); Deininger and Selod (2012); Zakout, Wehrmann, and Törhönen (2006) | | | |

| Infrastructure for Land Administration | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Deininger and Fedor (2009); Deininger and |
|---|-------|------|----|---------|--|
| | _ | | | | Selod (2012); Zakout, Wehrmann, and Törhönen (2006) |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.1.3 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 6.60 | |
| Total points for Category 1.1 | 11 | 11 | 22 | 24.20 | |
| 1.2 RESTRICTIONS ON PROPERTY LEASE AND OWNER | RSHIP | | | | |
| 1.2.1 Restrictions on Domestic Firms to Lease Property | | | | | |
| Restrictions on the Area of the Land for Lease for Domestic Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017) |
| Restriction on the Duration of the Lease for Domestic Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017) |
| Restriction on the Location of Property for Lease for Domestic Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017) |
| Restriction on Agricultural Property for Lease for Domestic Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017) |
| Restrictions on the Type of Property for Lease for Domestic Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017) |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.2.1 | 5 | 0 | 5 | Ve 5.50 | |
| 1.2.2 Restrictions on Domestic Firms to Own Property | | | | | |
| Restrictions on Ownership Based on the Area of the Land for Domestic Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Dasgupta and Singh (2006) |
| Restriction on the Location of Property for Land Ownership for Domestic Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Dasgupta and Singh (2006) |
| Restriction on Ownership of Agricultural Land for Domestic Firm | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Dasgupta and Singh (2006) |
| Restriction on Ownership by the Type of Building for Domestic Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Dasgupta and Singh (2006) |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.2.2 | 4 | 0 | 4 | 4.40 | |
| 1.2.3 Restrictions on Foreign Firms to Lease Property | | | | | |
| Restriction for Foreign Firms to Lease Based on the Area of the Land | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014) |
| Restriction on the Duration of Lease for Foreign Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014) |

| Restriction on the Location of Property Leasehold for Foreign Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014) |
|--|---|-------------------|-----------------------------|---|---|
| Restriction on the Lease of Agricultural Land for Foreign Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014) |
| Restrictions on Foreign Firms to Lease Based on Certain Type of Buildings (Residential, Commercial, Industrial) | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014) |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.2.3 | 5 | 0 | 5 | 5.50 | |
| 1.2.4 Restrictions on Foreign Firms to Own Property | | | | | |
| Restriction of Ownership on the Area of the Land for Foreign Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Liao and Zhang (2016); Tan (2004) |
| Restriction on the Duration of Ownership for Foreign Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Liao and Zhang (2016); Tan (2004) |
| Restriction on Property Ownership Based on Location for Foreign Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Liao and Zhang (2016); Tan (2004) |
| Restriction on the Ownership of Agricultural Land for Foreign Firms | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Liao and Zhang (2016); an (2004) |
| Restriction on the Ownership for Foreign Firms by Certain Type of buildings | 1 | n.a. | 1 | 1.10 | Liao and Zhang (2016); Tan (2004) |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.2.4 | 5 | 0 | 5 | 5.50 | |
| Total points for Category 1.2 | 19 | 0 | 19 | 20.90 | |
| | | | | | |
| 1.3 GENDER | | | | | |
| 1.3 GENDER Gender Incentives for Professional Participation | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Haltom and Tanimoto (2017); ILO (2018) |
| | 1 | 1 | 2 2 | 2.20 2.20 | Haltom and Tanimoto (2017); ILO (2018) |
| Gender Incentives for Professional Participation | | | | | Haltom and Tanimoto (2017); ILO (2018) |
| Gender Incentives for Professional Participation Total points for Subcategory 1.3 | 1 1 | 1 | 2 2 | 2.20 2.20 | |
| Gender Incentives for Professional Participation Total points for Subcategory 1.3 Total points for Category 1.3 | 1 1 | 1 | 2 2 | 2.20 2.20 | |
| Gender Incentives for Professional Participation Total points for Subcategory 1.3 Total points for Category 1.3 1.4 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULATIONS | 1 1 | 1 | 2 2 | 2.20 2.20 | |
| Gender Incentives for Professional Participation Total points for Subcategory 1.3 Total points for Category 1.3 1.4 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULA 1.4.1 Building Regulations Standards | 1 1 ATIONS | 1 1 AND ENV | 2 2 VIRONM | 2.20 2.20 ENTAL LIC | CENSES |
| Gender Incentives for Professional Participation Total points for Subcategory 1.3 Total points for Category 1.3 1.4 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULA 1.4.1 Building Regulations Standards Building Codes/Standards Applicable to All Constructions | 1 1 ATIONS | 1 1 AND ENV | 2 2 VIRONM | 2.20 2.20 ENTAL LIC 2.20 | CENSES IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |
| Gender Incentives for Professional Participation Total points for Subcategory 1.3 Total points for Category 1.3 1.4 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULA 1.4.1 Building Regulations Standards Building Codes/Standards Applicable to All Constructions Clear Provisions or Guidelines Regarding Safety Standards | 1 1 ATIONS 1 n.a. | 1 1 AND ENV | 2 2 /IRONM 2 1 | 2.20 2.20 ENTAL LIC 2.20 1.10 | IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |
| Gender Incentives for Professional Participation Total points for Subcategory 1.3 Total points for Category 1.3 1.4 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULA 1.4.1 Building Regulations Standards Building Codes/Standards Applicable to All Constructions Clear Provisions or Guidelines Regarding Safety Standards Regulation of Health Risk Related to Construction Materials | ATIONS 1 n.a. n.a. | 1 1 AND ENV | 2 2 7/IRONM 2 1 | 2.20 2.20 ENTAL LIC 2.20 1.10 | IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |
| Gender Incentives for Professional Participation Total points for Subcategory 1.3 Total points for Category 1.3 1.4 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULATION STANDARDS FO | 1 1 ATIONS 2 1 n.a. n.a. | 1 1 AND ENV | 2 2/IRONM 2 1 1 | 2.20 2.20 ENTAL LIO 2.20 1.10 1.10 1.10 | IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |

| Responsibility for Final Inspection | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |
|--|-----|----|----|-------|--|
| Inspection of Prohibited Materials in Construction | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |
| Type of Prohibited Materials Inspected | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |
| Liability for Structural Flaws/Problems | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |
| Requirement a to be an Architect or Engineer | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |
| Qualifications to Conduct Technical Supervision/Inspections | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013) |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.4.1 | 9 | 13 | 22 | 24.20 | |
| 1.4.2 Building Energy Codes and Standards | | | | | |
| Mandatory Minimum Energy Efficiency Performance Standards | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Garrido, Tapia, and Vergara (2019); Rosenberg et al. (2014) |
| Pre-condition to Provide Proof of Design Compliance with the Energy Efficiency Performance Standards | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Garrido, Tapia, and Vergara (2019); Rosenberg et al. (2014) |
| Energy Efficiency Performance Standards Are Verified as Part of the Building Plans Review Process | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Garrido, Tapia, and Vergara (2019); Rosenberg et al. (2014) |
| Incentives to Promote Green Building Standards | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Garrido, Tapia, and Vergara (2019); Rosenberg et al. (2014) |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.4.2 | n.a | 4 | 4 | 4.40 | |
| 1.4.3 Zoning and Land Use Planning | | | | | |
| Land Use and Zoning Regulations | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Babatunde, Yusuf, and Ogunbode (2016); Boonyabancha, Singhadej, and Dhanapal (2017); World Bank Group, Zoning and Land Use Planning |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.4.3 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | |
| 1.4.4 Environmental Clearances in Construction | | | | | |
| Existence of National Environmental Regulations during Construction | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015) |
| Update or Revision of National Environmental Regulations during Construction | 1 | 1 | 2 | | Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015) |
| Penalties or Fines in Place for Non-Compliance with the Regulations | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015) |

| Environmental Risks as Defined by Legal Framework | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); |
|---|----------|----------|------------|----------------------|--|
| Environmental Risks as Bernied by Begar Framework | 11.4 | 1 | • | 1.10 | Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan |
| Qualified Professional/Professional Agency to Conduct EIA | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | (2015) Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); |
| Qualified Frotessional/Frotessional Agency to Conduct EIA | II.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015) |
| Criteria that Trigger an EIA | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015) |
| Requirements for an EIA Process | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015) |
| Legal Responsibility for Checking Compliance | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015) |
| Legal Framework Mandates Public Consultations with Concerned Stakeholders | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015) |
| Public Consultations Requirement Elements | n.a | 1 | 1 | 1.10 | Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015) |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.4.4 | 3 | 10 | 13 | 14.40 | |
| 1.4.5 Dispute Mechanisms for Building Permits and Envir | onmental | Clearanc | es in Cons | struction | |
| Ability to Dispute Building Permit Decisions | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Ramanathan et al. (2018); Sánchez-Triana et al. (2014); Wang and Liu (2015); World Bank (2014) |
| Ability to Dispute Environmental Clearances and Permits | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Ramanathan et al. (2018); Sánchez-Triana et al. (2014); Wang and Liu (2015); World Bank (2014) |
| Out of Court Resolution Mechanisms for Environmental Disputes | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Ramanathan et al. (2018); Sánchez-Triana et al. (2014); Wang and Liu (2015); World Bank |
| out of Court Resolution weenamshis for Environmental Disputes | 1 | | | _ | (2014), wang and Elu (2013), world Bank (2014) |
| Total points for Subcategory 1.4.5 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 6.60 | |
| • | 1 | 3 31 | 6 47 | 6.60 52.00 | |

Note: n.a. = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = firm flexibility point; SBP = social benefits point

PILLAR II -QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION

2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF ONLINE SERVICES

2.1.1 Property Transactions-Digital Public Services

| 2111 Tropolog Transmissions Digital Ludic Soft News | | | | | | | | |
|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| Rescaled points | Rackground liferature | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | 0 Williamson (2001) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | 0 Williamson (2001) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | 0 Williamson (2001) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | 0 Williamson (2001) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | 0 Williamson (2001) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | 0 Williamson (2001) | | | | | | | |
| 2 13.20 | 0 | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | Gao et al. (2020); Green and Moser (2013); Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | (2013); Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | Gao et al. (2020); Green and Moser (2013); Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | Gao et al. (2020); Green and Moser (2013); Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | Gao et al. (2020); Green and Moser (2013); Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020) | | | | | | | |
| 10.90 | 0 | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | Deininger and Feder (2009) | | | | | | | |
| 2.20 | 0 Deininger and Feder (2009) | | | | | | | |
| , | 2.20 | | | | | | | |

| Cadastral Coverage at Main City Level | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Deininger and Feder (2009) |
|---|------------|-------|----|-------|---|
| Cadastral Coverage at the National Level | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Deininger and Feder (2009) |
| Total points for Subcategory 2.1.3 | 4 | 4 | 8 | 8.70 | |
| 2.1.4 Building Permits and Environmental Licenses-Digital | Public Ser | vices | | | |
| Online Platform for Issuing Building Authorizations | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020) |
| Online Permitting Systems with Several Functionalities | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020) |
| Online Permitting Systems to Submit Building and Occupancy Permits | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020) |
| Online System to Submit Environmental Licenses | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020) |
| Mechanism Available to File a Dispute Online on the Final Decision on Environmental Licensing | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020) |
| Total points for Subcategory 2.1.4 | 5 | 5 | 10 | 10.90 | |
| Total point for Category 2.1 | 20 | 20 | 40 | 43.50 | |
| 2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES | | | | | |
| 2.2.1 Interoperability for Property Transactions | | | | | |
| Interoperability between Land Registry and Cadaster | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | ILC (2017); NIST (2007) |
| Interoperability between Land Registry and other Services | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | ILC (2017); NIST (2007) |
| Existence of a Geographic Information System (GIS) | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | ILC (2017); NIST (2007) |
| Existence of a Unique Identifier between Land Registry and Cadaster | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | ILC (2017); NIST (2007) |
| Total points for Subcategory 2.2.1 | 4 | 4 | 8 | 8.70 | |
| 2.2.2 Interoperability for Building Permits | | | | | |
| Availability of Spatial Plans and Zoning Requirements to all Stakeholders | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Sarris, Tzovaras, and Doukas (2020) |
| | - 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Sarris, Tzovaras, and Doukas (2020) |
| Integration of GIS or National Spatial Platforms | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2,20 | ~ · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |
| Integration of GIS or National Spatial Platforms Total points for Subcategory 2.2.2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4.30 | (2007) |

| 2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION | | | | | |
|---|------------|------------|-------|-------|----------------------|
| 2.3.1 Transparency of Information for Immovable Property | 7 | | | | |
| Publication of Property Transactions Requirements | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Van der Molen (2007) |
| Transparency of Property Transactions Costs | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Van der Molen (2007) |
| Service Standards at the Land Registry | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Van der Molen (2007) |
| Transparency of Cadaster Costs | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Van der Molen (2007) |
| Service Standards for Cadaster | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Van der Molen (2007) |
| Availability of Statistics on Land Transactions | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Van der Molen (2007) |
| Availability of Statistics on Number and Type of Land Disputes | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Van der Molen (2007) |
| Availability of Statistics on the Average Time to Resolve Land Disputes | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Van der Molen (2007) |
| Total points for Subcategory 2 3.1 | 8 | 8 | 16 | 17.60 | |
| 2.3.2 Gender Data on Property Ownership | | | | | |
| Availability of Statistics Sex-Disaggregated Data on Property Ownership | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | FAO (2013) |
| Total points for Subcategory 2.3.2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | |
| 2.3.3 Transparency of Information for Building Permits and | d Environm | ental Lice | enses | | |
| Public Accessibility of Planning and Building Control Regulations | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | OECD (2019) |
| Public Online Availability of Requirements to Obtain all Types of Building Related Permits | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | OECD (2019) |
| Public Online Availability of Requirements Needed to Obtain Occupancy Permit | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | OECD (2019) |
| Applicable Fee Schedules for all Types of Construction Publicly Available and Up to Date | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | OECD (2019) |
| Public Online Availability of Requirements to Obtain Environmental Licensing for Constructing a Building with a Moderate Environmental Risk | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | OECD (2019) |
| Availability of Official, Updated and Publicly Available Online Statistics Tracking the Number of Issued Building Permits | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | OECD (2019) |
| Availability of Official, Updated and Publicly Available Online Statistics Tracking the Type of Issued Building Permits | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | OECD (2019) |
| Availability of Official, Updated and Publicly Available Online Statistics Tracking the Number of EIAs | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | OECD (2019) |

| Total points for Subcategory 2.3.3 | 8 | 8 | 16 | 17.60 | | | | | | |
|--|----|----|----|--------|-------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| 2.3.4 Transparency of Information on Zoning and Land Use | | | | | | | | | | |
| Updated City Master Plan/Zoning Plan | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Davis and Barlow (2017) | | | | | |
| Steps to Modify Zoning/Land Use Plan | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Davis and Barlow (2017) | | | | | |
| Adherence to Zoning Regulations | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2.20 | Davis and Barlow (2017) | | | | | |
| Total points for Subcategory 2.3.4 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 6.50 | | | | | | |
| Total points for Category 2.3 | 20 | 20 | 40 | 43.50 | | | | | | |
| Total points for Pillar II | 46 | 46 | 92 | 100.00 | | | | | | |

Note FFP = firm flexibility point; GIS = Geographic Information System; SBP = social benefits point

PILLAR III-EFFICIENCY: EFFICIENCY OF OBTAINING A BUSINESS LOCATION

3.1 EFFICIENCY OF PROPERTY TRANSFER

3.1.1 Time to Obtain a Business Location

| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | Rescaled points | Background literature |
|---|-----|------|--------------|-----------------|---|
| Time to Transfer Property | 25 | n.a. | 25 | 12.50 | Amadi-Enchendu and Pellissier (2014) |
| Time to Obtain a Building Permit | 25 | n.a. | 25 | 12.50 | Moussa and Li (2020); Wang and Cen (2016) |
| Time to Obtain an Occupancy Permit | 25 | n.a. | 25 | 12.50 | Kuprenas and Chalmers (1999); NAHB (2021) |
| Time to Obtain an Environmental Clearance in Construction | 25 | n.a. | 25 | 12.50 | Ghosh (2013) |
| Total points for Category 3.1 | 100 | n.a. | 100 | 50.00 | |

3.1.2 Cost to Obtain a Business Location

| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | Rescaled points | Background literature |
|---|-----|------|--------------|-----------------|---|
| Cost to Transfer Property | 25 | n.a. | 25 | 12.50 | IBA (2019); UNECE (2018) |
| Cost to Obtain a Building Permit | 25 | n.a | 25 | 12.50 | IBA (2019); UNECE (2018) |
| Cost to Obtain an Occupancy Permit | 25 | n.a | 25 | 12.50 | Kuprenas and Chalmers (1999); NAHB (2021) |
| Cost to Obtain an Environmental Clearance | 25 | n.a | 25 | 12.50 | Ghosh (2013) |
| Total points for Category 3.2 | 100 | n.a. | 100 | 50.00 | |
| Total points for Pillar III | 100 | n.a | 100 | 100.00 | |

Note: n.a. = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = firm flexibility point; SBP = social benefits point

References

- Amadi-Echendu, A. P., and R. Pellissier. 2014. "Eliminating Bottlenecks in the South African Conveyancing Environment." *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* 5 (5). doi:10.5901/mjss. 2014.v5n14p97.
- Babatunde, O. T., R. O., Yusuf, and E. B. Ogunbode. 2016. "Planning for Infrastructure Service Access in Nigerian Cities: An Overview of Policy and Practice." *Habitat International* 53: 156–66.
- Bennison, D. J. 2006. "Developing Effective Property Transaction Standards.' *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 24 (3): 216–35.
- Boonyabancha, S., R. Singhadej, and S. Dhanapal. 2017. "A GIS-based Approach to Land Use Planning for Hazardous Facilities: A Case Study of Rayong Province, Thailand." *Habitat International* 62: 61–70.
- Charalambous, E., E. Cimren, and S. Bano. 2018. "Digitalisation of Building Permitting Procedures in EU Cities." European Parliament.
- Dasgupta, P., and A. Singh. 2006. "Ownership Structure, Corporate Governance, and Firm Performance: Evidence from India." *Journal of Corporate Finance* 12 (4): 645–59.
- Davis, R., and T. Barlow. 2017. "Key Elements of Effective Zoning Regulations." *Journal of the American Planning Association* 83 (3): 236–48.
- Deininger, K., and G. Feder. 1996. "Property Registration and Title Systems in Developing Countries." Policy Research Working Paper 1610, World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Deininger, K., and G. Feder. 2009. "Land Registration, Governance, and Development: Evidence and Implications for Policy." World Bank Research Observer 24 (2): 233–66.
- Deininger, K., and H. Selod. 2012. "Strengthening Land Governance: Lessons Learned and Best Practices from Country Experiences." *World Bank Research Observer* 27 (2): 142–67.
- FAO (Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. 2013. *Women's Land Rights as a Pathway to Poverty Reduction: A Framework and Review of Available Evidence*. Rome: FAO.
- Gao, X., H. Chen, Y. Li, X. Li, and X. Deng. 2020. "Property Risk Identification Based on Machine Learning Algorithm in Due Diligence Process." *International Journal of Computational Intelligence Systems* 13(1): 387–97.
- Garrido, A., D. Tapia, and C. Vergara. 2019. "Compliance with Energy Codes in Buildings: A Review of International Experiences and Insights for Latin America." *Energy and Buildings* 198: 221–32.
- Gathii, J. T. 2013. "Comparative Land Tenure and Property Rights Systems in Africa." *Journal of African Law* 57 (2): 221–40.
- Ghosh, 2. 2013. "Demystifying the Environmental Clearance Process in India. 6 *NUJS Law Review* Rev. 3 (2013): 433–80.

- Golub, S. 2003. "Measures of Restrictions on Inward Foreign Direct Investment for OECD Countries." OECD Economics Department Working Paper No. 357, OECD Publishing, Paris. https://doi.org/10.1787/335043060125.
- Green, A., and C. Moser. 2013. "Do Property Rights Institutions Matter at the Local Level? Evidence from Madagascar." *Journal of Development Studies* 49 (1): 95–109.
- Grunwald, S., P. Bendt, and J. Kopfmüller. 2016. "Environmental Permits as an Instrument for Sustainable Planning and Decision Making in Infrastructure Projects." *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 60: 85–93.
- Gupta, M., and P. Bansal. 2014. "Environmental Impact Assessment of Construction Projects: A Comparative Analysis of the Legal Frameworks in India and the United States." *Journal of Environmental Management* 134: 57–66.
- Gupta, A., R. Dunning, and P. McAllister. 2020. "Online Conveyancing Portals in the UK: Benefits and Limitations." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 38 (3): 268–82.
- Halpern, P., and J. Lutz. 2014. "Land Leasing and Land Use Dynamics in Developing Country Cities." *Land Use Policy* 36: 330–37.
- Haltom, R. A., and R. Tanimoto. 2017. "Gender and Performance in the US Real Estate Industry." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 35 (2): 154–71.
- Hodge, T. R., and M. Greve. 2017. "Zoning, Land Use Planning, and the Local Economy." *Journal of Planning Literature* 32 (1): 3–14.
- IBA (International Bar Association). 2019. Transparency in Land Ownership: A Guide to Good Practice. IBA.
- IFC (International Finance Corporation), World Bank, and MIGA (Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency). 2013. "Good Practices for Construction Regulation and Enforcement Reform: Guidelines for Reformers." World Bank Group, Washington, DC.
- ILC (International Land Coalition). 2017. "Improving Land Governance through Interoperability." Briefing Paper. ILC. https://www.landcoalition.org/sites/default/files/documents/resources/ILC_Interoperability_Briefing_Paper_2017_0.pdf.
- ILO (International Labour Organization). 2018. "Women in Construction: The State of the Evidence on Drivers, Impacts and Solutions." https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_ent/---ifp_seed/documents/publication/wcms_644392.pdf.
- Kuprenas, J. A., and G. E. Chalmers. 1999. "Occupancy Permit Issuance: A Comparative Study." *Journal of Construction Engineering and Management* 125 (4): 283–87.
- Lee, S., J. Lee, and J. Lee. 2014. "The Effects of Ownership and Capital Structure on Performance: Evidence from Korean Firms." *Asia-Pacific Journal of Financial Studies* 43 (2): 177–202.
- Liao, R., and D. Zhang. 2016. "Property Rights, Investment Incentives, and Foreign Direct Investment." Journal of Comparative Economics 44 (4): 1088–1104.

- Linnenberg, T., T. Gür, and T. Gür. 2020. "Digitalisation of Building Permits: Perspectives and Approaches from Selected European Countries." *Journal of European Real Estate Research* 13 (3): 247–63.
- Moussa, I., and P. Li. 2020. "Building Permit Regulatory Burden Index: An Analysis of Building Permit Procedures and Associated Costs in US Municipalities." *Journal of Building Engineering* 29: 101157.
- NAHB (National Association of Home Builders). 2021. "Housing Affordability Is a Critical Issue." https://www.nahb.org/Advocacy/Housing-Affordability.
- NIST (National Institute of Standards and Technology). 2007. "Economic Impact of Property Rights: A Review of the Evidence." NIST. https://www.nist.gov/system/files/documents/itl/2007_economic_impact_property_rights.pdf.
- OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development). 2019. "Building Permit Transparency: Monitoring and Improving Permitting Systems." OECD.
- Ramanathan, R., M. Petersen, L. Srivastava, and K. Fahey. 2018. "Integrating Local Ecological Knowledge and Scientific Data to Inform Environmental Impact Assessments in Coastal Communities: Lessons from India." *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 73: 173–80.
- Rosenberg, M., J. Amann, H. Blum, and R. Sedano. 2014. "The Potential Impact of Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Policies on Electricity Markets and CO₂ Emissions of the US Building Sector." *Energy Policy* 73: 180–91.
- Ryan, C., and B. O'Regan. 2015. "Construction and the Environment: A Literature Review." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 109: 48–56.
- Sánchez-Triana, E., S. Enriquez, M. Khanna, J. E. Vinuales, and S. Jampani. 2014. *Balancing Development and Environmental Priorities: Lessons from the Experience of Industrialized Countries and Emerging Economies*. Washington, DC: The World Bank.
- Sarris, A., D. Tzovaras, and C. Doukas. 2020. "Digital Transformation of the Building Permit Process: The Case of Greece." *Buildings* 10 (3): 52.
- Tan, R. M. K. 2004. "Restrictions on the Foreign Ownership of Property: Indonesia and Singapore Compared." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 22 (1): 101–111. doi:10.1108/14635780410525162.
- UNECE (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe). 2018. *Real Estate Markets and Sustainable Development Goals: Challenges and Opportunities*. UNECE.
- Van der Molen, P. 2007. "Some Measures to Improve Transparency in Land Administration. TS IA-Land Administration Concepts. http://www.fig.net/resources/proceedings/fig_proceedings/fig2007/-papers/ts 1a/ts01a 05 molen 1304.pdf.
- Wang, X., and W. Cen. 2016. "The Impact of Building Permit Approval Speed on Local Economy." *Journal of Real Estate Research* 38 (3): 365–88.
- Wang, Y., and L. Liu. 2015. "Environmental Impact Assessment and Construction Project Delays: Empirical Evidence from China." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 102: 362–69.

- Wehrmann, B. 2008. *Land Conflicts: A Practical Guide to Dealing with Land Disputes*. Eschborn, Germany: GTZ (Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit).
- Williamson, I. P. 2001. "Land Administration 'Best Practice' Providing the Infrastructure for Land Policy Implementation." *Land Use Policy* 8 (4): 297–307. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0264-8377(01)00021-7.
- World Bank. 2014. Gender and Land Tenure in Sub-Saharan Africa. Washington DC: World Bank.
- World Bank Group. No date (n.d.). Zoning and Land Use Planning. https://urban-regeneration.worldbank.org/node/39#:~:text=Why%20is%20zoning%20necessary%3F,down%20 development%20in%20specific%20areas.
- Zakout, W., B. Wehrmann, and M-P Törhönen. 2006. "Good Governance in Land Administration Principles and Good Practices." Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), Rome.

Annex B. Business Location-Annotated Questionnaire

Annex B consists of a Glossary and Annotated Questionnaire for Business Location. The Annotated Questionnaire provides the mapping between each indicator and the corresponding question(s). Due to the presence of multiple questionnaires, the numbering of categories in the Annotated Questionnaire does not match the Business Location topic methodology note.

Glossary

Active fire safety measures: Systems that require some amount of action or motion in order to work effectively in the event of a fire (for example, fire extinguisher or sprinkler system).

Arbitration: Process of dispute resolution between a government agency responsible for issuing permits and an applicant seeking a permit. Arbitration may be used when there are disagreements or conflicts related to the issuance of a permit, such as when an application is denied or when conditions attached to a permit are contested.

Cadaster: An official register showing details of ownership, boundaries, and value of real property in a district, made for taxation purposes.

Conciliation: A form of alternative dispute resolution that is often used as an alternative to traditional litigation or arbitration. In conciliation, a neutral third party, called a conciliator, is appointed to facilitate the negotiation and mediation process between the parties. The conciliator does not have the power to make a final decision, but instead works to facilitate communication and understanding between the parties in order to reach a mutually acceptable agreement.

Commercial building: Buildings where commercial activities take place. Commercial buildings include office buildings, retail space, warehouses, and more.

Commercial construction: A property where the land is vacant of all buildings and the owner plans on constructing offices dedicated solely to conducting business (with no residential dwellings on site).

Contractual law: Law that involves agreements between people, businesses, and groups and carries legal responsibilities if the agreement is breached.

Dedicated green management teams: Teams in building and planning departments that are dedicated to helping builders plan and build green buildings.

Digitized documents: Information and data that have been transformed (digitized) from a physical format to a digital one. All physical copies of deeds and cadastral plans are scanned and converted to a pdf file and are saved on a computer.

Digitalized documents: All scanned (digitalized) pdf files are uploaded online and can be accessed anytime by anyone with an internet connection.

Direct surveying: Geodesic and topographic surveys that are conducted in situ (on-site surveying).

Discounted development application: A discount on the development application fee provided to builders as an incentive for adopting green building measures.

Environmental screening: The activity of deciding which matters will be investigated as part of the environmental assessment (EIA), once a decision has been made that an EIA is required (that is, once a screening decision has been made).

Environmental scoping: A more detailed process than environmental screening that aims to identify the key environmental issues and potential impacts that need to be addressed in a comprehensive environmental impact assessment.

Expedited permitting: Allows a municipality to offer a significant incentive for green buildings at little or no cost because this strategy only requires a shift in permitting priority.

Fire safety measures: A set of precautions and systems put in place to reduce the risk of fires and ensure the safety of occupants in a building. These measures are typically required by building codes and regulations, and may include both passive and active fire safety systems.

Floor-to-Area density (FAR) bonus: A zoning incentive offered by local governments to encourage developers to build more densely on a given parcel of land than the zoning code would otherwise allow.

Full environmental impact assessment: Evaluation of the effects of public and private projects on the environment. The assessment will be proportionate to the potential risks and impacts of the project, and will assess, in an integrated way, all relevant direct, indirect, and cumulative environmental and social risks and impacts throughout the project life cycle. Key stages in the environmental assessment process include screening, alternatives, preliminary assessment, scoping, mitigation, main EIA study and environmental impact statement, review, and monitoring.

Geographic Information System (GIS): A computer-based system designed to capture, store, analyze, manipulate, and present spatial or geographic data. It is a fully digital geographic representation of the plot of land, showing both the spatial information and the different attributes.

Green building standards: A model code that contains minimum requirements for increasing the environmental and health performance of buildings, sites, and structures.

Guarantee: Either the government or another authorized agency provides a legal guarantee that the person listed on the title has clear and undisputed ownership rights to that property.

Guarantee program: Incentive for green buildings that provides financial support to building owners, developers, or lenders to encourage the construction or renovation of buildings that meet certain environmental standards. The guarantee program provides a guarantee or insurance policy that the building will perform as intended and meet specified environmental standards. The guarantee may cover the cost of energy savings or other environmental benefits that the building will provide over a certain period of time, typically several years.

Housing development project: One or more buildings that collectively contain ten or more new or additional housing units on one or more parcels or lots under common ownership or control, including contiguous parcels.

Indirect surveying: The method of measuring land features and boundaries using indirect methods, such as aerial photography, satellite imagery, or remote sensing techniques.

List of requirements: Includes all the documents and steps necessary to obtain a building permit.

Mediation: Dispute resolution process that involves a neutral third party, called a mediator, facilitating negotiations between two or more parties involved in a permitting process. The goal of mediation is to help the parties reach a mutually acceptable agreement or settlement, without the need for a formal hearing or legal proceeding.

Mixed surveying: A combination of on-site surveying of land and indirect surveying.

National building code: The set of standards established at national level and enforced by local government for the structural safety of buildings.

Net metering: An electricity billing mechanism that allows consumers who generate some or all of their own electricity to use that electricity anytime, instead of when it is generated.

Out-of-court compensation mechanism: A compensation scheme established by law to compensate people who suffer loss or damage, through no fault of their own, because of an error at the land registry.

Passive fire safety measures: Systems that compartmentalize a building through the use of fire-resistance–rated walls/floors, doors, and gap-filling measures.

Phased inspections: Inspections that are carried out at specific stages during construction.

Private title insurance: Private title insurance guarantees indemnity to the new owner of a property if there is a defect in the title or encumbrances are discovered in the property later on.

Public consultation: Effective community engagement through disclosure of project-related information, consultation, and effective feedback in particular with affected communities, and in providing project-based grievance mechanisms. Such information will be disclosed in a timely manner, in an accessible place, and in a form and language understandable to project-affected parties and other interested parties.

Quality control: The strength of quality control and safety mechanisms during the construction process, the liability and insurance regimes, and professional certification requirements to conduct the construction.

Qualification exam: Any examination that one needs to pass in order to being able to practice legally as an engineer or architect.

Random/unscheduled technical inspection: Inspections that can occur at any time or at any stage during construction).

Regulatory relief: A nonfinancial incentive for green buildings that involves simplified regulatory processing or reduced regulatory processing for builders if green building elements are adopted in the construction.

Risk-based type inspections: The law assigns risk by outlining the classification of buildings by type, by occupancy or intended usage, and by size such as floor area and wall height among other relevant criteria.

Registration of deeds: A system whereby a register of documents is maintained relating to the transfer of rights in land.

Registration of title: A system whereby a register of ownership of land is maintained based on the parcel rather than the owner or the deeds transfer.

Simplified environmental impact assessment: Environmental permit involving environmental study with limited scope.

Strategic environmental assessment: A systematic examination of environmental and social risks and impacts, and issues associated with a policy, plan, or program, typically at the national level but also in smaller areas. The examination of environmental and social risks and impacts will include consideration of the full range of environmental and social risks and impacts.

State guarantee: The title is guaranteed by the state and in the event of a defect in the title, it is the state that will compensate for the loss.

Unique identifier: A unique identification number used by both the land registry and the cadaster to identify the same property in their databases.

University degree: Academic qualification of a four-year bachelor's degree or equivalent.

Zoning plan: The plan of area maintained in the office of the competent authority showing the permitted use of land and such other restrictions on the development of land as may be prescribed in the zoning regulations.

PROPERTY TRANSFER

The tables that follow present all indicators (including their components, if applicable) under each pillar, with a reference to the corresponding question number in parenthesis. The questions are listed before each table for ease of reference.

For Y/N questions, the Y response accounts for the score and is considered as the good practice, unless otherwise indicated with the sign "N \rightarrow good practice".

In the tables that follow, "AND" means all referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

In the tables that follow, "OR" means one or more referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

Certain questions are marked as "not scored," which indicates that they do not affect the score in any way. The purpose of these questions is to further inform and refine the questions design for subsequent years of the pilot, as needed, as well as to substantiate and provide further information for the scored questions.

Note: The gender indicator of the Business Location topic is shared between property transfer, building permits, and environmental permits. In those cases, the same question is asked for each area (property transfer, building permits, environmental permits). However, the scoring on the indicator is shared among the three areas to avoid triple counting. This shared indicator is marked with *. In terms of the scoring, the 1 point for this indicator feeds into the overall Business Location topic score based on the information collected from the three questionnaires.

| PILLAR I-QUALITY OF REGULATIONS FOR IMMOVABLE PROPERTY TRANSFER | | | | | |
|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| Parameters | | | | | |
| Largest city | The largest (most populous) city in the economy. Geographical location determines selection of appropriate property registry in charge of property transfer. For Pilar I, if regulations differ across states within an economy, the experts will be asked to provide information regarding regulations of the largest city. | | | | |

1.1 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR LAND ADMINISTRATION

1.1.1 Property Transaction Standards

- 1. Is there a legal obligation to verify the compliance of documents necessary for a property transaction with the law? (Y/N)
- 2. Please specify who is responsible to check that the sale deed is in compliance with the legal framework: (not scored)
 - 2a. Notary
 - 2b. Lawyer
 - 2c. Registrar
 - 2d. Interested parties
 - 2e. No one

- 3. Does the legal system require verification of the identity of each party engaged in a property transaction? (Y/N)
- 4. Is the control of the legality of documents done consistently in practice? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 5. Who is held responsible for verifying the identity of the parties to a property transfer? (not scored)
 - 5a. Notary
 - 5b. Lawyer
 - 5c. Registrar
 - 5d. Interested parties
 - 5e. No one
- 6. Is the verification of identity of parties done systematically in practice? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 7. Does the legal framework require that all property sale transactions be registered at the land registry to make them opposable to third parties? (Y/N)
- 8. Is the law implemented in practice? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 9. By law, which of the following documents, if obtained online, would have the same legal value as a paper-based one?
 - 9a. Property title certificate
 - 9b. Title search certificate
 - 9c. Tax certificate
 - 9d. Company profile document
 - 9e. Cadastral plans

1.1.2 Land Dispute Resolution Mechanism

- 10. According to the legal framework is arbitration offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for land disputes? (Y/N)
- 11. According to the legal framework, are conciliation and mediation offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for land disputes? (Y/N)
- 12. By law, does the land registry have an out-of-court compensation mechanism to allow for compensation payments to parties who suffer losses due to an error in title registration? (Y/N)
- 13. By law, is the property title subject to a guarantee? (Y/N)

1.1.3 Land Administration System

- 14. Does the legal framework specify who can obtain information on land ownership at the immovable property registration agency? (Y/N)
- 15. Which parties can obtain information on land ownership at the immovable property registry? (not scored)
 - 15a. Only intermediaries (notaries, lawyers, etc.)
 - 15b. Interested parties only
 - 15c. Anyone who pays the official fee
 - 15d. Freely accessible to anyone

- 15e. Information is not publicly available
- 15f. Other (please specify):
- 16. By law, is there a cadaster/mapping agency in your economy? (Y/N)
- 17. Does the legal framework specify who can consult cadastral plans of private land plots in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N)
- **18.** Which parties can consult cadastral plans of private land plots in [B-READY largest city]? (not scored)
 - 18a. Only intermediaries (notaries, lawyers, etc.)?
 - 18b. Interested parties only
 - 18c. Anyone who pays the official fee
 - 18d. Freely accessible by anyone
 - 18e. Information is not publicly available
 - 18f. Other (please specify):

| 1.1 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR LAND ADMINISTRATIO | N | | |
|--|-------|-------|----------------|
| | IN . | | |
| 1.1.1 Property Transaction Standards | 1 | T | , |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Compliance with the law (1) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Checking parties' identification (3) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Registering sales transactions (7) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Legality of online documents | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| - Property title certificate (9a) | 0.2 | 0.2 | 0.2 |
| - Title search certificate (9b) | 0.2 | 0.2 | 0.2 |
| - Tax certificate (9c) | 0.2 | 0.2 | 0.2 |
| - Company profile document (9d) | 0.2 | 0.2 | 0.2 |
| - Cadastral plans (9e) | 0.2 | 0.2 | 0.2 |
| Total points | 4 | 4 | 8 |
| 1.1.2 Land Dispute Resolution Mechanism | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Arbitration as an alternative dispute resolution (10) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Conciliation and mediation as an alternative dispute resolution (11) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Out-of-court compensation for losses (12) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Protection of property title (13) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| | | | |
| Total points | 4 | 4 | 8 |
| Total points 1.1.3 Land Administration System | 4 | 4 | 8 |
| • | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| 1.1.3 Land Administration System | _ | - | 1 2 |
| 1.1.3 Land Administration System Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| 1.1.3 Land Administration System Indicators Disclosure of land registry information (14) | FFP 1 | SBP 1 | Total points 2 |

Note on the scoring: If the component is present, the corresponding score is assigned. For example, if 9a and 9b and 9c are selected, a score of 0.2 is assigned for each. The same applies to the tables that follow, unless specified otherwise.

1.2 RESTRICTIONS ON PROPERTY LEASING AND OWNERSHIP

1.2.1 Restrictions on Domestic Firms to Lease Property

- **19.** By law, are there any restrictions to lease or own property for domestic firms? (Y/N; N-good practice) (not scored)
- 20. Please specify whether the restrictions are for lease or ownership. (not scored)

20a. Lease

20b. Ownership

- 21. For each of the following, please indicate whether or not there are any legal restrictions to lease a property for domestic firms.
 - 21a. Area of the and
 - 21b. Duration
 - 21c. Location of property
 - 21d. Agricultural land
 - 21e. Height of building
 - 21f. Other (please specify)

1.2.2 Restrictions on Domestic Firms to Own Property

- 22. For each of the following, please indicate whether or not there are any legal restrictions to own a property for domestic firms.
 - 22a. Area of the land
 - 22b. Location of property
 - 22c. Agricultural land
 - 22d. Height of building
 - 22e. Other (please specify)

1.2.3 Restrictions on Foreign Firms to Lease Property

- **23.** By law, are there any restrictions to lease or own a property for foreign firms? (Y/N; N-good practice) (not scored)
- 24. Please specify whether the restrictions are for lease or ownership. (not scored)

24a. Lease

24b. Ownership

- 25. For each of the following, please indicate whether or not there are any legal restrictions to lease a property for foreign firms.
 - 25a. Area of the and
 - 25b. Duration
 - 25c. Location of property
 - 25d. Agricultural land
 - 25e. Height of building

1.2.4 Restrictions on Foreign Firms to Own Property

26. For each of the following, please indicate whether or not there are any legal restrictions to own a property for foreign firms.

26a. Area of the and

26b. Duration

26c. Location of property

26d. Agricultural land

26e. Height of building

| 1.2 RESTRICTIONS ON PROPERTY LEASING AND OWNERS | SHIP | | |
|---|------|-----|---------------------|
| 1.2.1 Restriction on Domestic Firms to Lease Property | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Legal restrictions to lease a property for domestic firms | 5 | 5 | 10 |
| - Area of the land (21a) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Duration (21b) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Location of property (21c) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Agricultural land (21d) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Height of building (21e) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Total points | 5 | 5 | 10 |
| 1.2.2 Restriction on Domestic Firms to Own Property | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Legal restrictions to own a property for domestic firms | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| - Area of the land (21a) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Location of property (21b) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Agricultural land (21c) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Height of building (21d) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Total points | 4 | 4 | 8 |
| 1.2.3 Restriction on Foreign Firms to Lease Property | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Legal restrictions to lease a property for foreign firms | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| - Area of the land (25a) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Duration (25b) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Location of property (25c) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Agricultural land (25d) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Height of building (25e) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Total points | 5 | 5 | 10 |
| 1.2.4 Restriction on Foreign Firms to Own Property | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Legal restrictions to own a property for foreign firms | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| - Area of the land (26a) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Duration (26b) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Location of property (26c) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Agricultural land (26d) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| | 1 4 | | |
| - Height of building (26e) Total points | 1 | 1 | 2 |

Note: FFP = firm flexibility point; SBP = social benefit point.

1.3 GENDER INCENTIVES

1.3.1 Gender Incentives for Professional Participation

- 27. Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to property transactions? (Y/N)
- 28. Please select all professions for which such incentives exist: (not scored)
 - 28a. Notary
 - 28b. Property lawyers
 - 28c. Registrar
 - 28d. Real estate agent
 - 28e. Loan officer
 - 28f. Other (please specify)
- 29. Please specify which incentive programs are provided for women in order to increase their representation in the professions you have selected: (not scored)
 - 29a. Grant
 - 29b. Scholarships
 - 29c. Training
 - 29d. Recruitment policies
 - 29e. Prize and awards
 - 29f. Other (please specify)

| 1.3 GENDER INCENTIVES* | | | |
|---|-----|-----|--------------|
| 1.3.1 Gender Incentives for Professional Participation | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to property transactions (27) 0.33 0.66 | | | |
| Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to construction* 0.33 0.66 | | | |
| Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to environmental clearances* 0.33 0.66 | | | |
| Total points | 1 | 1 | 2 |

Note: FFP = firm flexibility point; SBP = social benefit point.

^{*}Shared indicators between property transfer, building permits, and environmental permits.

| PILLAR II-QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION | | |
|--|---|--|
| Parameters | | |
| Largest city | The largest (most populous) city in the economy. The land registry, the tax authorities, and the cadastral services of the largest city will be considered for all questions under Pillar II. For all questions in Pillar II, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se. | |

2.1 AVAILABIITY AND RELIABILITY OF ONLINE SERVICES

2.1.1 Property Transaction–Digital Public Services

- 30. Can due diligence checking for transfer of ownership be conducted online? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 31. What type of due diligence checking for transferring property ownership can be conducted online?
 - 31a. Title search
 - 31b. Encumbrances
 - 31c. Outstanding taxes
 - 31d. Bankruptcy search
 - 31e. Company profile
- 32. Please specify if the information requested online are:
 - 32a. Accurate (precise, no errors)
 - 32b. Current (latest information)
 - 32c. Detailed (all information provided)
 - 32d. Reliable (information can be verified)
- 33. If due diligence checking can be conducted online, is there a single platform where all these checks can be done without being redirected to different websites? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 34. Is there a fully functional online platform to register the transfer of property ownership? (Y/N)
- 35. Please indicate whether the following processes are available on the online platform to register the transfer of property ownership:
 - 35a. Downloading documents
 - 35b. Uploading documents
 - 35c. Getting notifications
 - 35d. Obtaining documents
 - 35e. Processing payments
- 36. Is there an online platform where complaints about services and/or suggestions for improvements at the immovable property registry can be filed? (Y/N)
- 37. Are the responses to complaints from the immovable property registry publicly available on this platform? (Y/N)
- 38. Is there an online platform where complaints about services and/or suggestions for improvements at the cadaster/mapping agency can be filed? (Y/N)
- 39. Are the responses to complaints from the cadaster/mapping agency publicly available on this platform? (Y/N)

2.1.2 Property Transaction–Reliability of Infrastructure

- **40.** Is there a comprehensive and fully functional electronic database for checking encumbrances (liens, mortgages, restrictions, charges, etc.)? (Y/N)
- 41. Please indicate whether searches can be conducted for each of the following:

- 41a. Liens
- 41b. Mortgages
- 41c. Easements
- 41d. Restrictions
- 42. Which of the following group(s) can access this database? (Y/N) (not scored)
 - 42a. Accessible online to registered users
 - 42b. Accessible only by professionals (lawyers/notaries)
 - 42c. Accessible only by land registry staff
 - 42d. Accessible to anyone at the land registry premises
- 43. Which of the following best describes the format that land title certificates are kept at the immovable property registry?
 - 43a. Digitized
 - 43b. Digitalized
 - 43c. Paper format
- 44. Which of the following best describes the format that cadastral certificates are kept at the cadaster/mapping agency?
 - 44a. Digitized
 - 44b. Digitalized
 - 44c. Paper format
- 45. Which of the following best describes the method used for cadastral surveying?
 - 45a. Direct
 - 45b. Indirect
 - 45c. Mixed
- 46. Is there an electronic national database for verifying the accuracy of government-issued identity documents of parties engaged in property transactions? (Y/N)
- 2.1.3 Property Transaction-Coverage
- 47. Are all privately held land plots formally registered at the immovable property registry in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N)
- 48. Are all privately held land plots formally registered at the immovable property registry in the economy? (Y/N)
- 49. For each of the following, please indicate whether or not the following are reasons that privately held plots are not registered at the immovable property registry: (not scored)
 - 49a. Not mandatory by law to register titles
 - 49b. Registration fees too high
 - 49c. Cumbersome process
 - 49d. Inconsistent legal framework
 - 49e. Informal payments
 - 49f. Poor public land service management
 - 49g. Poor infrastructure
- 50. Are all privately held land plots formally mapped (surveyed and registered in the cadaster) in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N)

- 51. Are all privately held land plots formally mapped (surveyed and registered in cadaster) in [the economy]? (Y/N)
- 52. For each of the following, please indicate whether or not the following are reasons that privately held plots are not mapped at the mapping agency (cadaster) (not scored)
 - 52a. Lack of financial resources
 - 52b. Informal payments
 - 52c. Lack of infrastructure
 - 52d. Poor public land service management
 - 52e. Lack of surveyors
 - 52f. Lack of political will
 - 52g. Most land is agricultural land
 - 52h. Most lands belong to communities
 - 52i. Conflict

| 2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF ONLINE SERVICES | | | |
|---|------|------|---------------------|
| 2.1.1 Property Transaction-Digital Public Services | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Online platform encumbrance checking | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Title search (ownership) (31a) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Encumbrances (liens, charges) (31b) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Outstanding taxes (tax agency) (31c) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Bankruptcy search (31d) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Company profile (31e) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| Single online platform for encumbrance checking | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Accurate (precise, no errors) (32a) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |
| - Current (latest information) (32b) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |
| - Detailed (all information provided) (32c) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |
| - Reliable (information can be verified) (32e) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |
| Online platform for property transfer (34) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Processes available online for property transfer | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Downloading forms (35a) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Uploading documents (35b) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Getting notifications (35c) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Obtaining documents (35d) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Processing payment (35e) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| Complaint mechanisms for immovable property registry | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Online platform for complaints (36) | 0.50 | 0.50 | 1.00 |
| - Responses to complains made publicly available (37) | 0.50 | 0.50 | 1.00 |
| Complaint mechanisms for cadaster | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Online platform for complaints (38) | 0.50 | 0.50 | 1.00 |
| - Responses to complains made publicly available (39) | 0.50 | 0.50 | 1.00 |
| Total points | 6 | 6 | 12 |
| 2.1.2 Property Transactions-Reliability of Infrastructure | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Infrastructure database for checking encumbrances | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Liens (41a) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |
| - Mortgages (charges) (41b) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |
| - Restrictions (41c) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |
| - Easements (41d) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |

| Format of land title certificates | 1 | 1 | 2 |
|---|------|------|--------------|
| - Titles are digitalized (43a) OR | 1 OR | 1 OR | 2 OR |
| - Titles are digitized (43b) | 0.50 | 0.50 | 1 |
| Score of 1 if the titles are digitalized (accessible on the cloud) or 0.5 point | 0.50 | 0.50 | 1 |
| if they are digitized (pdf saved on a computer) | | | |
| Format of cadastral plans | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Titles are digitalized (44a) OR | 1 OR | 1 OR | 2 OR |
| | 0.50 | 0.50 | 2 OK |
| - Titles are digitized (44b) | 0.30 | 0.50 | 1 |
| Score of 1 if the titles are digitalized (accessible on the cloud) or 0.5 | | | |
| point if they are digitized (pdf saved on a computer) | | | |
| Method to conduct cadastral surveying (45a OR 45c) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Infrastructure database for checking identification (46) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Total points | 5 | 5 | 10 |
| 2.1.2 Property Transactions-Coverage | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Property registration coverage at main business city level (47) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Property registration coverage at national level (48) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Cadastral coverage at main city level (50) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Cadastral coverage at national level (51) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Total points | 4 | 4 | 8 |

2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES

2.2.1 Interoperability of Property Transactions

- 53. Which of the following best describes the format in which information is recorded by the immovable property registration agency and the cadaster/mapping agency in [B-READY largest city]:
 - 53a. A single database containing both legal and geographical information
 - 53b. Different but linked databases (where information is automatically updated and shared between the two institutions)
 - 53c. Separate databases
- 54. Is the immovable property registration agency linked to an agency, other than the cadaster? (Y/N)
- 55. Please specify the agency(ies) linked to the land registry: (not scored)
 - 55a. Beneficial ownership agency
 - 55b. Business registry
 - 55c. Tax agency
 - 55d. Other (please specify)
- 56. Is there a Geographical Information System (GIS) used by the land administration agency in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N)
- 57. Do the immovable property registration and the cadastral/mapping agencies in [B-READY largest city] use the same unique identifier to search for properties? (Y/N)

| 2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES | | | | |
|--|-----|-----|---------------------|--|
| 2.2.1 Interoperability of Property Transactions | | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Interoperability between land registry and cadaster (53a OR 53b) | 1 | 1 | 1 | |
| Interoperability between land registry and other services (54) 1 1 2 | | | | |
| Existence of a Geographic Information System (GIS) (56) | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Existence of a unique identifier between land registry and cadaster (57) | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Total points | 4 | 4 | 8 | |

2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION

2.3.1 Transparency of Information for Immoveable Property

- 58. Is the list of documents required to complete all types of property transactions available online and up to date (all latest changes are provided)? (Y/N)
- 59. Which best indicates the availability of list of documents online? (not scored)
 - 59a. Available online and regularly updated
 - 59b. Available online but not regularly updated
- 60. Is the applicable fee schedule for all types of property transactions at the immovable property registration agency available online and up to date (all latest changes are provided)? (Y/N)
- 61. Which best indicates the availability of the updated fee schedule online? (not scored)
 - 61a. Available online and regularly updated
 - 61b. Available online but not regularly updated
- 62. Does the land registry publish online the time it will take to deliver a legally binding document proving property ownership? (For example, the land registry states that it will deliver a property title in 5 working days.) (Y/N)
- 63. Is the timeframe to deliver a legally binding document proving property ownership respected in practice? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 64. Is the applicable fee schedule to access cadastral plans publicly available online and up to date (all the latest changes are provided)?
 - 64a. Available online and regularly updated
 - 64b. Available online but not regularly updated
- **65.** Is the cadastral plan available online for free? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 66. Does the cadaster/mapping agency publish online the time it will take to deliver a certified most updated cadastral plan (for example, 5 working days to obtain a certified most updated cadastral plan)? (Y/N)
- 67. Is the time published by the cadaster to deliver a certified most updated cadastral plan respected in practice? (Y/N) (not scored)

- 68. Are there official, updated, and publicly available online statistics tracking the number and type of transactions at the immovable property registry in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 69. How many years of statistics tracking number and type of transactions at the immoveable property registry are available?

```
69a. Available for 1 year
```

- 69b. Available for 2 years
- 69c. Available for 3 years
- 69d. Available for 4 years
- 69e. Available for 5 years or more
- 70. Are there official, updated and publicly available online statistics tracking the number and types of land disputes at the national level? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 71. How many years of statistics tracking the number and type of land disputes are available?
 - 71a. Available for 1 year
 - 71b. Available for 2 years
 - 71c. Available for 3 years
 - 71d. Available for 4 years
 - 71e. Available for 5 years or more
- 72. Are there official, updated, and publicly available statistics tracking the average time it takes to resolve land disputes? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 73. How many years of statistics tracking the average time it takes to resolve land disputes are available?
 - 73a. Available for 1 year
 - 73b. Available for 2 years
 - 73c. Available for 3 years
 - 73d. Available for 4 years
 - 73e. Available for 5 years or more
- 2.3.2 Sex-Disaggregated Land Registry Data
- 74. Does the land registry in [B-READY largest city] collect data separately on male and female ownership? (Y/N)
- 75. Which of the below data are collected separately for male and female land ownership? (not scored)
 - 75a. Sole ownership
 - 75b. Joint ownership
 - 75c. Other (please specify)
- 76. Are these data available for the most recent calendar year (2022)? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 77. Are these data anonymized? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 78. Are these data publicly available online? (Y/N) (not scored)

| 2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION | | | |
|--|---------|--------------------|---------------------|
| 2.3.1 Transparency of Information for Immoveable Property | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Publication of property transactions requirements (58) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Transparency of property transactions costs (60) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Service standards at the land registry (62) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Transparency of cadaster costs (64a) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Service standards for cadaster (66) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Availability of statistics on land transactions | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Available for 1 year (69a) OR | 0.20 OR | 0.20 OR | 0.40 OR |
| - Available for 2 years (69b) OR | 0.40 OR | 0.40 OR | 0.80 OR |
| - Available for 3 years (69c) OR | 0.60 OR | 0.60 OR | 1.20 OR |
| - Available for 4 years (69d) OR | 0.80 OR | 0.80 OR | 1.60 OR |
| - Available for 5 years or more (69e) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Score of 1 point assigned if 69e selected; 0.8 point if 69d selected; 0.6 | | | _ |
| points 69c selected; 0.4 points if 69b selected; 0.2 point if 69a selected | | | |
| Availability of statistics on number and type of land disputes | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Available for 1 year (71a) OR | 0.20 OR | 0.20 OR | 0.40 OR |
| - Available for 2 years (71b) OR | 0.40 OR | 0.40 OR | 0.80 OR |
| - Available for 3 years (71c) OR | 0.60 OR | 0.60 OR | 1.20 OR |
| - Available for 4 years (71d) OR | 0.80 OR | 0.80 OR | 1.60 OR |
| - Available for 5 years or more (71e) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Score of 1 point assigned if 71e selected; 0.8 point if 71d selected; 0.6 | | 1 | _ |
| points 71c selected; 0.4 points if 71b selected; 0.2 point if 71a selected | | | |
| | | | 2 |
| disputes | 1 | 1 | _ |
| - Available for 1 year (73a) OR | 0.20 OR | 0.20 OR | 0.40 OR |
| - Available for 2 years (73b) OR | 0.40 OR | 0.20 OR 0.40 OR | 0.40 OR 0.80 OR |
| - Available for 3 years (73c) OR | 0.60 OR | 0.60 OR | 1.20 OR |
| - Available for 4 years (73d) OR | 0.80 OR | 0.80 OR | 1.60 OR |
| - Available for 5 years or more (7e) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Score of 1 point assigned if 73e selected; 0.8 point if 73d selected; 0.6 | 1 | 1 | - |
| points 73c selected; 0.4 points if 73b selected; 0.2 point if 73a selected | | | |
| Total points | 8 | 8 | 16 |
| 2.3.2 Sex-Disaggregated Land Registry Data | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Gender data on property ownership (74) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Total points | 1 | 1 | 2 |

| PILLAR III-EFFICIENCY OF PROPERTY TRANSFER IN PRACTICE | | |
|--|--|--|
| Parameters | | |
| Largest city | The largest (most populous) city in the economy. Geographical location determines selection of appropriate property registry in charge of property transfer. For all questions under Pillar III, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se. | |

| Value of property | For estimation of cost of property transfer, a parameter of value of property is provided (based on 100 times GNI [gross national income] per capita). This value of property is provided in local currency. For all questions under Pillar III, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter, unless specified otherwise in the question per se. |
|-------------------|---|
|-------------------|---|

3.1 EFFICIENCY OF PROPERTY TRANSFER IN PRACTICE

Further information (based on the scope of the topic):

- Both selling and buying companies are owned by private nationals
- Type of property under consideration is a commercial property

79. Please indicate what is the legal form of land ownership in [B-READY largest city] (not scored)

79a. Full title

79b. Lease

79c. State-owned land use right

79d. Right of occupancy

80. What is the type of property registration system in place in [B-READY largest city]: (not scored)

80a. Registration of deeds

80b. Registration of title

80c. Both

Due Diligence Process

When completing the "due diligence" table, please consider only the processes that are applicable in [B-READY largest city] based on the legal ownership and registration system in place or commonly done in practice. For the connection with the parameters above, please indicate the typical characteristics. Please leave blank the rows that are not applicable when doing the due diligence checking. While providing cost estimates please keep parameter of value of property in mind.

81. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete each of the following steps:

- 81a. Encumbrance checking
- 81b. Title search (to confirm ownership)
- 81c. Obtain authorization to transfer state owned land
- 81d. Outstanding taxes (property or other taxes)
- 81e. Bankruptcy
- 81f. Utilities (outstanding bills)
- 81g. Company profile
- 81h. Cadastral plan
- 81i. Zoning plan
- 81j. Building certificate from municipal council
- 81k. Inform the local council of sale and selling price
- 811. Drainage certificate from water authority
- 81m. Identification survey from licensed surveyor
- 81n. Other (please specify)

82. On average, what is the cost (in local currency) to complete each of the following steps:

- 82a. Encumbrance checking
- 82b. Title search (to confirm ownership)
- 82c. Obtain authorization to transfer state owned land
- 82d. Outstanding taxes (property or other taxes)

- 82e. Bankruptcy
- 82f. Utilities (outstanding bills)
- 82g. Company profile
- 82h. Cadastral plan
- 82i. Zoning plan
- 82j. Building certificate from municipal council
- 82k. Inform the local council of sale and selling price
- 821. Drainage certificate from water authority
- 82m. Identification survey from licensed surveyor
- 82n. Other (please specify)

Signing of the Sale Deed

When completing the "signing of the sale deed" table, please consider only the processes that are applicable in [B-READY largest city] based on the legal ownership and registration system in place. While providing cost estimates please keep parameter of value of property in mind.

83. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete each of the following steps:

- 83a. Drafting of the sale contract by notary/lawyer
- 83b. Meeting with parties and signing of sale deed (or land use right transfer contract) in the notary/lawyer's office
- 83c. Other (please specify)

84. On average, what is the cost (in local currency) to complete each of the following steps:

- 84a. Drafting of the sale contract by notary/lawyer
- 84b. Meeting with parties and signing of sale deed (or land use right transfer contract) in the notary/lawyer's office

Registration of Sale Deed

When completing the "registration of the sale deed" table, please consider only the processes that are applicable in [B-READY largest city] based on the legal ownership and registration system in place. While providing cost estimates please keep parameter of value of property in mind.

Note: Registration of the sale deed (or state own land transfer contract) at the land registry until registration is complete and transaction is opposable to third parties.

85. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete each of the following steps:

- 85a. Payment of transfer tax (tax authority)
- 85b. Payment of registration fees (land registry)
- 85c. Payment of stamp duty (when applicable)
- 85d. Registering the same deed at the land registry

86. On average, what is the cost (in local currency) to complete each of the following steps:

- 86a. Payment of transfer tax (tax authority)
- 86b. Payment of registration fees (land registry)
- 86c. Payment of stamp duty (when applicable)
- 86d. Registering the same deed at the land registry

87. What is the total time to complete the entire process to transfer the ownership of a commercial property from one domestic company to another domestic company (calendar days)?

88. What is the total cost to complete the entire property transfer process between two domestic companies (local currency)?

| 3.1 TIME | | | |
|---|------------|------|--------------|
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Time to Transfer Property (87) Also corroborated with 81a–81m, 83, 85 | 100 (100%) | n.a. | 100 (100%) |
| Total points | 100 | n.a. | 100 |
| 3.2 COST | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Cost to Transfer Property (88) Also corroborated with 82a–82m, 84, 86 | 100 (100%) | n.a. | 100 (100%) |
| Total points | 100 | n.a. | 100 |

Note: n.a. = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = firm flexibility point; SBP = social benefit point.

The data on the indicators for Pillar III will be normalized to a common unit—for example, on the scale from 0 to 100 points, where 0 represents the lowest and 100 represents the best performance. In turn, best (worst) performance is defined by the highest (lowest) standards and/or practices, measured as a single point or range of values.

BUILDING PERMITS QUESTIONNAIRE

The tables that follow present all indicators (including their components, if applicable) under each pillar, with a reference to the corresponding question number in parenthesis. The questions are listed before each table for ease of reference.

For Y/N questions, the Y response accounts for the score and is considered as the good practice, unless otherwise indicated with the sign "N–good practice".

In the tables that follow, "AND" means all referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

In the tables that follow, "OR" means one or more referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

Certain questions are marked as "not scored," which indicates that they do not affect the score in any way. The purpose of these questions is to further inform and refine the questions design for subsequent years of the pilot, as needed, as well as to substantiate and provide further information for the scored questions.

Note: The gender indicator of the Business Location topic is shared between property transfer, building permits, and environmental permits. In those cases, the same question is asked for each area (property transfer, building permits, environmental permits). However, the scoring on the indicator is shared among the three areas to avoid triple counting. This shared indicator is marked with *. In terms of the scoring, the 1 point for this indicator feed into the overall Business Location topic score based on the information collected from the three questionnaires.

| PILLAR I-QUALITY OF REGULATIONS FOR IMMOVABLE PROPERTY LEASE, PROPERTY OWNERSHIP, AND URBAN PLANNING | | |
|--|--|--|
| Parameters | | |
| Largest city | The largest (most populous) city in the economy. Geographic location determines the relevant regulatory framework governing building and environmental permits. In many economies, legislation governing building and environmental permits is defined at city and municipal level. For Pillar I, if regulations differ across states within an economy, the experts will be asked to provide information regarding regulations of the largest city. | |

1.1 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULATIONS AND ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITS

1.1.1 Building regulations standards

- 1. Is there a national building code and/or a unified set of building standards applicable to all construction in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N)
- 2. Please indicate whether the national building code and/or a unified set of building standards provide clear provisions or guidelines for each of the following:
 - 2a. Natural disaster resistant construction (e.g., floods, storms, earthquakes, etc.)
 - 2b. Building classification according to certain criteria (e.g., usage; size)
 - 2c. Active and passive fire safety measures
 - 2d. Soil testing requirements for certain permanent building types

- 2e. Structural strength (materials to be used)
- 3. Does the regulatory framework require permits for the handling, removal, and disposal of regulated construction materials (such as asbestos, lead, mercury-containing devices, polychlorinated biphenyls [PCB]) that pose health risks? (Y/N)
- 4. Which of the below materials are regulated?
 - 4a. Asbestos
 - 4b. Lead-containing pipes, components, paints
 - 4c. Mercury-containing fluorescent lamps, thermostats, and electric devices
 - 4d. Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCB) in electric transformers, fluorescent light ballasts, caulk, and masonry joints
- 5. Does the law prohibit use of any of the following construction materials in new buildings?
 - 5a. Asbestos
 - 5b. Lead-containing pipes, components, paints
 - 5c. Mercury-containing fluorescent lamps, thermostats, and electric devices
 - 5d. Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCB) in electric transformers, fluorescent light ballasts, caulk, and masonry joints
- 6. Is there a requirement by law to inspect and/or test construction materials to ensure that regulated construction materials (such as asbestos, lead, mercury-containing devices, polychlorinated biphenyls [PCB]) are not being used during construction? (Y/N)
- 7. Which of the below materials are required to be inspected/tested by law?
 - 7a. Asbestos
 - 7b. Lead-containing pipes, components, paints
 - 7c. Mercury-containing fluorescent lamps, thermostats, and electric devices
 - 7d. Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCB) in electric transformers, fluorescent light ballasts, caulk, and masonry joints
- 8. Which agency is responsible for the inspections/testing? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 9. Does the law require verification of compliance of building plans with existing building regulations? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 10. According to the law, who is responsible for verifying compliance of building plans with existing building regulations?
 - 10a. Public agency: Certified/licensed engineer or architect
 - 10b. Public agency: Somebody other than an architect or engineer
 - 10c. Private and external firms of certified architects and/or civil engineers, not part of the building company
 - 10d. Internal review by the architect/engineer who prepared the plans
- 11. The person who is responsible for conducting the verification of compliance of building plans in the public agency is: (not scored)
 - 11a. Certified/licensed engineer
 - 11b. Certified/licensed architect
 - 11c. A representative of the public agency who is neither an architect nor engineer

- **12.** Does the law require verification of compliance with structural and building safety aspects? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 13. What types of technical inspections for structural safety (if any) are required by law to be carried out during construction? (Y/N)
 - 13a. Random/unscheduled inspections
 - 13b. Phased inspections
 - 13c. Risk-based inspections
 - 13d. None
- 14. Is a final inspection required by law before a building can be used or occupied? (Y/N)
- 15. If final inspection before building occupancy is mandated by law, is it implemented in practice? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 16. Is liability for structural defects in [B-READY largest city] defined by law once a building is in use or occupied? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 17. If there are structural problems in a building once it is in use, are the responsible architects or engineers legally held liable according to the law? (Y/N)
- 18. What is the length of time for which an architect or an engineer can be held liable according to the law? (not scored)
 - 18a. Less than 1 year
 - 18b. 1 year to less than 2 years
 - 18c. 2 years to less than 5 years
 - 18d. 5 years or more
- 19. According to the law, is the professional or agency conducting technical inspections during construction held liable for structural defects or problems once the building is in use? (Y/N)
- 20. What is the length of time for which the professional or agency conducting technical inspections during construction can be held liable according to the law? (not scored)
 - 20a. Less than 1 year
 - 20b. 1 year to less than 2 years
 - 20c. 2 years to less than 5 years
 - 20d. 5 years or more
- 21. According to the law, is the construction company held liable for structural defects or problems once the building is in use? (Y/N)
- 22. What is the length of time for which the construction company can be held liable according to the law? (not scored)
 - 22a. Less than 1 year
 - 22b. 1 year to less than 2 years
 - 22c. 2 years to less than 5 years
 - 22d. 5 years or more
- 23. Is a university degree (a four-year bachelor's degree or graduate degree) mandatory by law to be recognized as an architect or an engineer? (Y/N)

- 24. What type of qualification is legally required to conduct technical supervisions/inspections of construction projects?
 - 24a. Is an architect or engineer
 - 24b. Years of practical experience
 - 24c. Member of association of architects or engineers
 - 24d. Pass an exam
- 25. When leasing a building in [B-READY largest city], please select which of the following applies by law when obtaining a new use and occupancy permit: (not scored)
 - 25a. All new leases require a new use and occupancy permit
 - 25b. A new use and occupancy permit is required only when there is a change of building use
 - 25c. No new use and occupancy permit is required when leasing a building, the original permit is sufficient

1.1.2 Building Energy Codes and Standards

- 26. Are there legally required minimum energy-efficiency performance standards in the building code or any other building regulations? (Y/N)
- 27. How often are these standards enforced in practice? (not scored)
 - 27a. Very often
 - 27b. Somewhat often
 - 27c. Not very often
 - 27d. Not often at all
- 28. Is proof of compliance with energy-efficiency standards included as a precondition for obtaining a building permit? (Y/N)
- 29. Are energy-efficiency standards proof of design compliance part of the preconditions for issuing a building permit? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 30. Please indicate which elements of the energy-efficiency performance standards are verified as part of the building plans review process?
 - 30a. Thermal transmittance or insulation calculations for building envelope
 - 30b. Solar heat gain calculations for building envelope
 - 30c. Glazing factors for fenestration
 - 30d. Heating/cooling demand calculations
 - 30e. Daylighting and orientation
 - 30f. Permanent shading
 - 30g. Air barrier, air leakage or air infiltration
 - 30h. Efficiency of heating and cooling equipment and controls
 - 30i. Efficiency of water heating equipment and controls
 - 30j. Efficiency of lighting fixtures and controls
- 31. Are there any incentives, mandated by law or in practice, provided to builders in order to promote green building standards? (Y/N)
- 32. Among the following financial incentives, which of these are mandated by law? (not scored)
 - 32a. Property tax incentives
 - 32b. Grants/subsidies/loan programs
 - 32c. Net metering

- 32d. Discounted development application
- 33. Among the following financial incentives, which of carried out in practice? (not scored)
 - 33a. Property tax incentives
 - 33b. Grants/subsidies/loan programs
 - 33c. Net metering
 - 33d. Discounted development application
- 34. Among the following non-financial incentives, which of these are mandated by law? (not scored)
 - 34a. Floor-to-Area density (FAR) bonus
 - 34b. Expedited permitting
 - 34c. Business planning assistance
 - 34d. Marketing assistance
 - 34e. Regulatory relief
 - 34f. Guarantee program
 - 34g. Dedicated green management teams in building and planning departments
- 35. Among the following non-financial incentives, which of these are carried out in practice? (not scored)
 - 35a. Floor-to-Area density (FAR) bonus
 - 35b. Expedited permitting
 - 35c. Business planning assistance
 - 35d. Marketing assistance
 - 35e. Regulatory relief
 - 35f. Guarantee programs
 - 35g. Dedicated green management teams in building and planning departments
- 1.1.3 Gender Incentives for Professional Participation
- 36. Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to construction? (Y/N)
- 37. Please select all professions for which such incentives exist: (not scored)
 - 37a. Engineers
 - 37b. Architects
 - 37c. Surveyors
 - 37d. Others
- 38. Please select the incentive programs from the following list which are provided for women in order to increase their representation in the professions you have selected: (not scored)
 - 38a. Scholarships
 - 38b. Training programs
 - 38c. Grants
 - 38d. Recruitment policies
 - 38e. Prizes and awards
 - 38f. Other incentive programs

1.1.4 Zoning and Land Use Planning

39. Do formal land use planning/zoning regulations exist in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N) (not scored)

40. Do the formal land use planning/zoning regulations incorporate any of the below:

- 40a. Requirements for trunk infrastructure availability (water, electricity, sanitation)
- 40b. Hazard maps that identify areas in which construction is not permitted due to natural hazards
- 40c. Hazard maps that identify minimum separation between residential and hazardous occupancies
- 40d. Maps that identify areas in which construction of buildings is not permitted in relation to natural resources

1.1.5 Dispute Resolution Mechanisms for Environmental Clearances in Construction and Building Permitting

41. Does the building regulation /code/standard have any provisions to dispute the decision of the building authority? (Y/N)

| 1.1 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULATIONS AND ENVIRONMENTAL LICENSES | | | |
|--|--|--------------|---------------------|
| 1.1.1 Building Regulations Standards | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Building codes/standards applicable to all constructions (1) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Clear provisions or guidelines regarding safety standards | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| - Natural disaster resistant construction (e.g., floods, storms, | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 |
| earthquakes, etc.) (2a) | | | |
| - Building classification according to certain criteria (e.g., usage; size) | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 |
| (2b) | _ | | |
| - Active and passive fire safety measures (2c) | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 |
| - Soil testing requirements for certain permanent building types (2d) | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 |
| - Structural strength (materials to be used) (2e) | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 |
| Regulation of health risk related to construction materials (3) | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| List of regulated materials | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| - Asbestos (4a) | 0 | 0.25 | 0.25 |
| - Lead-containing pipes, components, paints (4b) | 0 | 0.25 | 0.25 |
| - Mercury-containing fluorescent lamps, thermostats, and electric | 0 | 0.25 | 0.25 |
| devices (4c) | | | 0.25 |
| - Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCB) in electric transformers, fluorescent | 0 | 0.25 | 0.25 |
| light ballasts, caulk, and masonry joints (4d) | | | 1 |
| Prohibition of use of construction materials | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| - Asbestos (5a) | 0 | 0.25 | 0.25 |
| - Lead-containing pipes, components, paints (5b) | $\begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ | 0.25 0.25 | 0.25 0.25 |
| - Mercury-containing fluorescent lamps, thermostats, and electric devices (5c) | U | 0.23 | 0.23 |
| - Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCB) in electric transformers, fluorescent | 0 | 0.25 | 0.25 |
| light ballasts, caulk, and masonry joints (5d) | | 0.23 | 0.23 |
| Responsibility for compliance with legal requirements (10a OR 10c) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Type of inspections carried out during construction (13b OR 13c) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Final inspection required by law (14) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Liability for structural flaws/problems (17 OR 19 OR 21) | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Score assigned if either/all 17,19 or 21 selected | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Requirement a to be an architect or engineer (23) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Qualifications to conduct technical supervision/inspections | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Is an architect or engineer (24a) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |
| - Years of practical experience (24b) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |
| - Member of association of architects or engineers (24c) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 |

| - Pass an exam (24d) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.50 | |
|---|--|--------------|---------------------|--|
| Total points | 7 | 11 | 18 | |
| 1.1.2 Building Energy Codes and Standards | | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Mandatory minimum energy-efficiency performance standards (26) | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| Precondition to provide proof of design compliance with the energy- | | | | |
| efficiency performance standards (28) | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| Energy-efficiency performance standards are verified | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| - Thermal transmittance or insulation calculations (30a) | 0 | 0.10 | 0.10 | |
| - Solar heat gain calculations for building envelope (30b) | 0 | 0.10 | 0.10 | |
| - Glazing factors for fenestration (30c) | 0 | 0.10 | 0.10 | |
| - Heating/cooling demand calculations (30d) | 0 | 0.10 | 0.10 | |
| - Daylighting and orientation (30e) | 0 | 0.10 | 0.10 | |
| - Permanent shading (30f) | 0 | 0.10 | 0.10 | |
| - Air barrier, air leakage or air infiltration (30g) | 0 | 0.10 | 0.10 | |
| - Efficiency of heating and cooling equipment and controls (30h) | 0 | 0.10 | 0.10 | |
| - Efficiency of water heating equipment and controls (30i) | $\begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ | 0.10 0.10 | 0.10 0.10 | |
| - Efficiency of lighting fixtures and controls 29j) | - | | | |
| Incentives to promote green building standards (30) | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| Total points | 0 | 4 | 4 | |
| 1.1.3 Gender Incentives for Professional Participation* | | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.66 | |
| in professions related to property transactions* | 0.55 | 0.55 | 0.00 | |
| Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to construction (36) | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.66 | |
| Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women | | | | |
| in professions related to environmental clearances* | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.66 | |
| Total points | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| 1.1.4 Zoning and Land Use Planning | | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Land use and zoning regulations | 1 | 1 | 1 | |
| - Requirements for trunk infrastructure availability (water, electricity, sanitation)? (40a) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.25 | |
| - Hazard maps or related means that identify areas in which construction is not permitted due to natural hazards (40b) | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.25 | |
| - Hazard maps or related means that identify minimum separation | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.25 | |
| between residential and hazardous occupancies (40c) - Maps or related means that identify areas in which construction of | 0.25 | 0.25 | 0.25 | |
| buildings is not permitted in relation to natural resources (40d) | 0 | 0 | 0 | |
| - None in existence (40f) | 1 | 1 | 1 | |
| Total points | - | - | - | |
| 1.1.5 Dispute Resolution Mechanisms for Environmental Clearan Permits | ces in Cons | truction and | ı bullaing | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Ability to dispute building permit decisions (41) | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Total points | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Note: FFP - firm flevibility point: SRP - social benefit point | | | | |

Note: FFP = firm flexibility point; SBP = social benefit point.
*Shared indicators between property transfer, building permits, and environmental permits.

| PILLAR II-QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION | | | |
|--|---|--|--|
| Parameters | | | |
| Largest city | The largest (most populous) city in the economy. Geographic location determines the relevant regulatory framework governing building and environmental permits. In many economies, legislation governing building and environmental permits is defined at city and municipal level. For all questions in Pillar II, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se. | | |

2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABITY OF ONLINE SERVICES

2.1.1 Building Permits and Environmental Licenses-Digital Public Services

- 42. Is there an online platform for issuing building authorizations (for example, an online platform that can be used for planning approvals, constructions permits, and occupancy permits)? (Y/N)
- 43. Which of the following best describes the level of integration for the online platform?
 - 43a. The online platform does not integrate any relevant authorizations from agencies outside of the planning/building departments.
 - 43b. The online platform integrates some relevant authorizations from agencies outside of the planning/building departments.
 - 43c. The online platform integrates authorizations from all relevant agencies from organizations outside of the planning/building departments.
 - 43d. None of the above
- 44. Please indicate if the online platform allows the following electronic features:
 - 44a. Online payment
 - 44b. Online communication
 - 44c. Online notification
 - 44d. Online submission
 - 44e. Auto-generated checklist
- 45. Please indicate whether or not an electronic system allows for each of the following permits:
 - 45a. Building permits
 - 45b. Occupancy permits
- 46. Can final decisions on building permits be disputed online? (Y/N)

| 2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF ONLINE SERVICES | | | | |
|--|-----------|-----------|-----------|--|
| 2.1.1 Building Permits and Environmental Licenses-Digital Public Services | | | | |
| Indicators FFP SBP Total points | | | | |
| Online platform for issuing building authorizations - Online platform for building authorizations and integration of all relevant authorizations from organizations outside of the planning/building departments (43a) OR | 1 1 OR | 1 1 OR | 2 2 OR | |

| - Online platform for building authorizations and integration of some relevant authorizations from organizations outside of the planning/building departments (43b) A score of 1 is assigned if 43a selected, a score of 0.5 assigned if 43b assigned | 0.5 | 0.5 | 1 |
|--|------|------|----------|
| Electronic permitting systems with several functionalities | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Online payment (44a) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Online communication (44b) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Online notification (44c) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Online submission (44d) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Auto-generated checklist (44e) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| Electronic permitting systems to submit building and occupancy | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| permits | | | |
| - Building permit can be obtained online (45a) | 0.50 | 0.50 | 1.00 |
| - Occupancy permit can be obtained online (45b) | | 0.50 | 1.00 |
| Mechanism available to file a dispute online on the final decision on | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| building permits (46) | 1 | 1 | <i>2</i> |
| Total points | 5 | 5 | 10 |

2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES

2.2.1 Interoperability of Building Permits

47. Are spatial plans and zoning requirement available to all stakeholders in the form of a Geographic Information System (GIS) or other spatial data platforms?

- 47a. Yes, available through an online portal for information purposes, but the online extract is not valid for official procedures
- 47b. Yes, available from a central location (e.g., national spatial planning system, GIS, or registry of urban plans) and can be digitally exchanged for processing construction-related permits
- 47c. Not available in a digital form from a central location but can be provided in a digital form on an ad hoc basis to any interested party (e.g., USB media, CD disk)

48. Are the GIS and/or national spatial platforms integrated between the permit-issuing agency and other stakeholder agencies (i.e., cadaster, land registries, municipal departments, utility service providers, etc.)? (Y/N)

| 2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES | | | |
|---|-----|-----|--------------|
| 2.2.1 Interoperability for Building Permits | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Availability of spatial plans and zoning requirements to all stakeholders (47b) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Integration of GIS or national spatial platforms (48) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Total points | 2 | 2 | 4 |

Note: FFP = firm flexibility point; GIS = Geographic Information System; SBP = social benefit point.

2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION

2.3.1 Transparency of Information on Building Permits and Environmental Licenses

- 49. Are planning and building control regulations publicly accessible? (Y/N)
- 50. How are planning and building control regulations made available? (not scored)
 - 50a. Available online and up to date
 - 50b. Online but not up to date
 - 50c. They are available on request, free of charge
 - 50d. They are available for a fee
- **51.** Are the requirements to obtain any type of building related permits published online? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 52. Which of the following information to obtain building related permits online to the general public?
 - 52a. All required pre-approvals of the drawings/plans by the relevant agencies (i.e., electrical, water, sewerage, environmental, etc.)
 - 52b. List of required documents to submit to request and obtain a building permit (i.e., land ownership certificate, types of drawings and plans, etc.)
 - 52c. Requirements to obtain occupancy permit
- 53. Is the applicable fee schedule for all types of construction available online and up to date?
 - 53a. Yes, available online and updated
 - 53b. Available online but not updated
 - 53c. No, not available to the public
- 54. Are there official, updated and publicly available online statistics tracking the number of issued building permits? (Y/N) (Not scored)
- 55. How many years of statistics tracking the number of issued building permits are available?
 - 55a. Available for 1 year
 - 55b. Available for 2 years
 - 55c. Available for 3 years
 - 55d. Available for 4 years
 - 55e. Available for 5 years or more
- **56.** Are there official, updated, and publicly available online statistics tracking the type of issued building permits? (Y/N) (*Not scored*)
- 57. How many years of statistics tracking the type of issued building permits are available? (Not scored)
 - 57a. Available for 1 year
 - 57b. Available for 2 years
 - 57c. Available for 3 years
 - 57d. Available for 4 years
 - 57e. Available for 5 years or more
- 58. Does [B-READY largest city] have a city master plan/zoning plan which has been updated in the last 10 years? (Y/N)

2.3.2 Transparency of Information on Zoning and Land Use

59. Are there clear, defined steps to modifying the zoning/land use plan in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N)

60. How is adherence to zoning regulations verified before submitting building permit application in [B-READY largest city]?

- 60a. Through zoning maps of city accessible to builder online to verify that the project's intended location in in compliance with zoning regulations
- 60b. Permit issuing authority checks the zoning compliance after receiving building permit application with no involvement from builder
- 60c. Builder obtains urban planning approval from planning agency before obtaining building permit

| 2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION | | | | |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| 2.3.1 Transparency of Information on Building Permits and Env | 2.3.1 Transparency of Information on Building Permits and Environmental Licenses | | | |
| Indicators FFP SBP Total poi | | | | |
| Public accessibility of planning and building control regulations (49) | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Public online availability of requirements to obtain all types of building related permits | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| - All required pre-approvals of the drawings/plans by the relevant agencies (i.e., electrical, water, sewerage, environmental, etc.) (52a) | 0.50 | 0.50 | 1 | |
| - List of required documents to submit to request and obtain a building permit (i.e., land ownership certificate, types of drawings and plans, etc.) (52b) | 0.50 | 0.50 | 1 | |
| Public online availability of requirements needed to obtain occupancy permit (52c) | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Applicable fee schedules for all types of construction publicly available and up to date (53) | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Official and up-to-date statistics publicly available online on number | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| of issued building permits Statistics are available for the past 5 years (55a) OR Statistics are available for the past 4 years (55b) OR Statistics are available for the past 3 years (55c) OR Statistics are available for the past 2 years (55d) OR Statistics are available for 1 year only (55e) Score: Up to 1 point if 55a selected; score of 0.8 if 55b selected, score of 0.6 if 55c selected, score of 0.4 if 55d selected and score of 0.2 if 55e selected | 1.00 OR 0.80 OR 0.60 OR 0.40 OR 0.20 | 1.00 OR 0.80 OR 0.60 OR 0.40 OR 0.20 | 2.00 OR 1.50 OR 1.20 OR 0.80 OR 0.40 | |
| Total points | 5 | 5 | 10 | |
| 2.3.2 Transparency of Information on Zoning and Land Use | | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Updated city master plan/zoning plan (58) | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Steps to modify zoning/land use plan (59) | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Adherence to zoning regulations (60a OR 60b) | 1 | 1 | 2 | |
| Total points | 3 | 3 | 6 | |

Note: FFP = firm flexibility point; SBP = social benefit point.

PILLAR III-EFFICIENCY OF OBTAINING AN OCCUPANCY PERMIT IN PRACTICE

The data for Pillar III on the Efficiency of Occupancy Permits are collected through firm-level surveys, using the following questions:

- 61. Over the last two years, did this establishment apply for an occupancy permit, certifying a building as compliant with applicable laws and code? (not scored)
- 62. Time to obtain occupancy permits: In reference to the most recent application, approximately how many days did it take to obtain the occupancy permit from the day of the application to the day the permit was granted?
- 63. Cost to obtain occupancy permits: What was the total cost of obtaining that occupancy permit, including application, inspection, and other required fees?

Alternative scenario: In case the data collection on time and cost to obtain occupancy permits through firm-level surveys is not feasible, such data are collected through expert consultations using the following parameters and questions:

| Parameters | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Largest city | The largest (most populous) city in the economy. Geographical location determines selection of regulatory framework at municipal and sub-national level. For all questions under Pillar III, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se. |
| Largest municipality | The selection of municipality affects the responses provided by experts on the efficiency of services provided. For all questions under Pillar III, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se. |
| | Building regulations, type and level of pre-approvals, documents to be submitted and fees vary depending on the type of construction being permitted (typically classified as residential, commercial or industrial). The size of building affects the cost of permitting and in some cases, it can affect the number of inspections to be conducted during construction. |
| Type and size of building | Some specific parameters to be considered for efficiency of obtaining a building permit in practice: Type of building: commercial building, in particular, an office building Size of commercial building: 10,000 square feet (929.03 square meters), 2000 square feet (185.8 square meters per floor) Floors: 5 floors (each floor will be 3 meters (9 ft and 10 inches) high) Land plot: 6500 sq feet (603.8 square meters) |

Preparation of Building Permits

- 64. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete each of the following steps:
 - 64a. Obtain ownership/property certificate
 - 64b. Obtain a topographical survey
 - 64c. Obtain a geotechnical investigation
 - 64d. Urban planning approval

- 64e. Technical conditions from utility providers
- 64f. Submit application to permitting authorities and obtain building permit
- 64g. Inspections by any agency prior to building permit
- 64h. Other step(s) (please specify)

65. On average, what does it cost (in local currency) to complete each of the following steps:

- 65a. Obtain ownership/property certificate
- 65b. Obtain a topographical survey
- 65c. Obtain a geotechnical investigation
- 65d. Urban planning approval
- 65e. Technical conditions from utility providers
- 65f. Submit application to permitting authorities and obtain building permit
- 65g. Inspections by any agency prior to building permit
- 65h. Other step(s) (please specify)

66. What is the total time to complete the entire process to obtain a building permit for a commercial property-office building type (calendar days)?

67. What is the total cost to complete the entire process of obtaining both a building permit for a commercial property-office building type (local currency)?

68. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete each of the following steps:

- 68a. Submit use and occupancy permit application
- 68b. Review of application and site plan by permitting authority
- 68c. Schedule and receive inspection by permitting authority
- 68d. Receive occupancy permit
- 68e. Other step(s) (please specify)

69. On average, what does it cost (in local currency) to complete each of the following steps:

- 69a. Submit use and occupancy permit application
- 69b. Review of application and site plan by permitting authority
- 69c. Schedule and receive inspection by permitting authority
- 69d. Receive occupancy permit
- 69e. Other step(s) (please specify)

| 3.1 TIME TO OBTAIN BUILDING PERMIT | | | | |
|---|------------|------|--------------|--|
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Time to Obtain Building Permit (66) Further corroborated with data from 64a–64h | 100 (100%) | n.a. | 100 (100%) | |
| Total points | 100 | n.a. | 100 | |
| 3.2 COST TO OBTAIN BUILING PERMIT | | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Cost to Obtain Building Permit (67) Further corroborated with data from 65a–65h | 100 (100%) | n.a. | 100 (100%) | |
| Total points | 100 | n.a. | 100 | |
| 3.3 TIME TO OBTAIN OCCUPANCY PERMIT | | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Time to Obtain Occupancy Permit (62) | 100 (25%) | n.a. | 100 (25%) | |

| Further corroborated with data from 68a–68e | | | |
|--|-----------|------|--------------|
| Total points | 100 | n.a. | 100 |
| 3.4 COST TO OBTAIN OCCUPANCY PERMIT | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Cost to Obtain Occupancy Permit (63) Further corroborated with data from 69a–69e | 100 (25%) | n.a. | 100 (25%) |
| Total points | 100 | n.a. | 100 |

Note: n.a. = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = firm flexibility point; SBP = social benefit point.

The data on the indicators for Pillar III will be normalized to a common unit—for example, on the scale from 0 to 100 points, where 0 represents the lowest and 100 represents the best performance. In turn, best (worst) performance is defined by the highest (lowest) standards and/or practices, measured as a single point or range of values.

ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITS QUESTIONNAIRE

The tables that follow present all indicators (including their components, if applicable) under each pillar, with a reference to the corresponding question number in parenthesis. The questions are listed before each table for ease of reference.

For Y/N questions, the Y response accounts for the score and is considered as the good practice, unless otherwise indicated with the sign "N \rightarrow good practice".

In the tables that follow, "AND" means all referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

In the tables that follow, "OR" means one or more referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

Certain questions are marked as "not scored," which indicates that they do not affect the score in any way. The purpose of these questions is to further inform and refine the questions design for subsequent years of the pilot, as needed, as well as to substantiate and provide further information for the scored questions.

Note: The gender indicator of the Business Location topic is shared between property transfer, building permits, and environmental permits. In those cases, the same question is asked for each area (property transfer, building permits, environmental permits). However, the scoring on the indicator is shared among the three areas to avoid triple counting. This shared indicator is marked with *. In terms of the scoring, the 1 point for this indicator feed into the overall Business Location topic score based on the information collected from the 3 questionnaires.

| PILLAR I-QUALITY OWNERSHIP, AND UI | OF REGULATIONS FOR IMMOVABLE PROPERTY LEASE, PROPERTY RBAN PLANNING |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Parameters | |
| Largest city | The largest (most populous) city in the economy. Geographical location determines the relevant regulatory framework governing environmental permits. For Pillar I, if regulations differ across states within an economy, the experts will be asked to provide information regarding regulations of the largest city. |
| Type and size of project | The type and size of project (housing development project) determines the type of environmental permitting required. A specific parameter of the construction of a new residential dwelling housing development project is provided, with a total surface area of residential housing development project of 10 acres (40,468 sqm). The type of residence considered is detached single family house with 1, 2, and 3 bedrooms, each with its own driveway, and the estimated number of houses are 100 single family homes, with an estimated 600 residents. |

1.1 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULATIONS AND ENVIRONMENTAL LICENSES

1.1.1 Environmental Clearances in Construction

1. Are there any national or local regulations or standards related to pollution and waste management in construction activities that are applicable in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N)

- 2. Have these regulations or standards been updated or revised in the past five years to reflect new environmental and technological developments related to pollution and waste management in construction activities? (Y/N)
- 3. Have penalties or fines been established in [B-READY largest city] to enforce compliance with regulations or standards regarding pollution and waste management? (Y/N)
- 4. Does the legal framework on environment projects in [B-READY largest city] clearly define environmental risks in new building construction projects? (Y/N)
- 5. What types of environmental risks are defined in the legal framework regarding new building construction projects? (not scored)
 - 5a. Projects that may affect biodiversity and natural resources threatening to the protection, conservation, maintenance and restoration of natural habitats and biodiversity, including ecosystems, protected areas, and forests.
 - 5b. Projects that may contribute to greenhouse gas emissions or are vulnerable to climate change impacts.
 - 5c. Projects that may affect cultural heritage sites or artifacts, including archaeological and historic sites
 - 5d. Projects that may cause physical or biological hazards, such as contamination of air, water, soil, or noise pollution.
 - 5e. Projects that may require land acquisition, resettlement, and/or rehabilitation of affected communities.
 - 5f. Projects that may pose occupational health and safety risks to workers, such as exposure to hazardous materials or dangerous working conditions.
 - 5g. Projects that may require pest management measures, such as the use of pesticides or other chemicals.
 - 5h. Projects that may generate or release pollutants, such as wastewater, solid waste, or air emissions, and require measures to prevent or abate pollution.
 - 5i. Projects that may affect water resources, including water quality, quantity, and access, and require measures to manage and conserve water resources.
- 6. Is it mandatory by law that an environmental impact assessment (EIA) must be conducted by a qualified professional or professional agency? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 7. In practice, who prepares and conducts the environmental impact assessment (EIA)? (not scored)
 - 7a. Project owner
 - 7b. Professional agency or independent expert
 - 7c. It is not conducted in practice
 - 7d. Other (please specify)
- 8. Based on the legal framework for a housing development project as described earlier, what criteria would trigger an environmental impact assessment (EIA)?
 - 8a. Size of project
 - 8b. Geographical location
 - 8c. Nature of industry
 - 8d. Other (please specify)
- 9. Based on the existing legal framework, does the environmental impact assessment (EIA) process include each of the following mandatory requirements (select all that applies):

- 9a. Scoping and baseline studies (identification of the scope of the assessment, including the issues to be addressed and the potential environmental impacts of the proposed project)
- 9b. Impact assessment (identification and evaluation of the potential positive and negative environmental impacts of the proposed project, including direct and indirect impacts, short-term and long-term impacts, and cumulative impacts)
- 9c. Mitigation measures (development of measures to avoid, minimize, or compensate for the negative environmental impacts of the proposed project, and enhancement of positive impacts
- 9d. Public participation (Consultation with the public and other stakeholders to obtain their views on the proposed project and the potential environmental impacts, and consideration of their concerns and suggestions in the decision-making process)
- 9e. Monitoring and follow-up: implementation of a monitoring program to verify the accuracy of the impact predictions, and to ensure that the mitigation measures are effective in reducing the negative environmental impacts

10. According to the legal framework, what type of review is the EIA subject to?

- 10a. Internal review (undertaken by the responsible authority or other government agency, with or without formal guidelines and procedure)
- 10b. Internal review (undertaken by the responsible authority or other government agency, with or without formal guidelines and procedure)
- 11. Is public participation with concerned stakeholders mandatory by law for environmental impact assessments (EIAs)? (Y/N)
- 12. Does the legal framework for EIAs include the following activities and approaches that enable stakeholders to contribute to the decision-making?
 - 12a. Information in a form and language understandable to project-affected parties and other interested parties
 - 12b. Clear and accessible information (in an accessible place, online, in gazettes, media etc.)
 - 12c. Surveys and polls to capture inputs and feedback from the stakeholders
 - 12d. Capacity buildings (training, resources, and technical assistance to stakeholders, as needed)

1.1.2 Gender Incentives for Professional Participation

- 13. Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to environmental clearances for construction projects in [B-READY largest city]? (Y/N)
- 14. Please indicate the professions for which such incentives exist: (not scored)
 - 14a. Surveyors
 - 14b. Environmental specialists/engineers
 - 14c. Other (please specify)
- 15. Please specify which incentive programs are provided for women in order to increase their representation in the professions you have selected: (not scored)
 - 15a. Scholarships
 - 15b. Training programs
 - 15c. Grants
 - 15d. Recruitment policies
 - 15e. Prizes and awards
 - 15f. Others (please specify)

1.1.3 Dispute Resolution Mechanisms for Environmental Clearances in Construction

- 16. According to the legal framework can environmental clearances and permits be disputed by any party? (Y/N)
- 17. According to the legal framework, is arbitration offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for disputing environmental clearances and permits? (Y/N)
- 18. According to the legal framework are conciliation and mediation offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for disputes? (Y/N)
- 19. Which agency/body is responsible for handling such disputes in [B-READY largest city]? (not scored)
 - 19a. Independent tribunal or arbitrator dedicated to handle environmental clearances and permits.
 - 19b. Regulator
 - 19c. Environment ministry/department providing environmental clearances, permits
 - 19d. Other (please specify)

| 1.1 REGULATORY STANDARDS FOR BUILDING REGULATIONS AND ENVIRONMENTAL | | | | |
|--|-----|------|--------------|--|
| 1.1.1 Environmental Clearances in Construction | | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points | |
| Existence of national environmental regulations during construction (1) | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| Update or revision of national environmental regulations during construction (2) | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| Penalties or fines in place for non-compliance with the regulations (3) | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| Environmental risks as defined by legal framework (4) | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| Qualified professional/professional agency to conduct EIA (6) | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| Criteria that trigger an EIA | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| - Extent (size) of project | 0 | 0.33 | 0.33 | |
| - Nature of industry | 0 | 0.33 | 0.33 | |
| - Geographical location | 0 | 0.33 | 0.33 | |
| Requirements for an EIA process | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| - Scoping and baseline studies (9a) | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 | |
| - Impact assessment (9b) | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 | |
| - Mitigation measures (9c) | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 | |
| - Public participation (9d) | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 | |
| - Monitoring and follow-up (9e) | 0 | 0.20 | 0.20 | |
| Legal responsibility for checking compliance | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| - Internal review (10a) | 0 | 0.50 | 0.50 | |
| - External (10b) | 0 | 0.50 | 0.50 | |
| Requirement of public consultation with concerned stakeholders (11) | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| Requirement for public consultations | 0 | 1 | 1 | |
| - Ensuring that the information is provided in a language that is | 0 | 0.25 | 0.25 | |
| accessible to the intended audience (12a) | | | | |
| - Disseminating information about the meeting in advance (12b) | 0 | 0.25 | 0.25 | |
| - Ensuring that the meeting takes place at a time and place that are | | 0.25 | 0.25 | |
| appropriate for the stakeholders (12c) | | | | |
| - Ensuring that the meeting does not take place at a stage where all | 0 | 0.25 | 0.25 | |
| relevant decisions concerning the project have been made (12d) | | | | |

| Total points | 0 | 10 | 10 |
|---|------|------|--------------|
| 1.1.2 Gender Incentives for Professional Participation* | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to property transactions* | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.66 |
| Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to construction* | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.66 |
| Are there any incentives for increasing the representation of women in professions related to environmental clearances (13) | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.66 |
| Total points | 1.00 | 1.00 | 2.00 |
| 1.1.3 Dispute Resolution Mechanisms for Environmental Clearances in Construction | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Ability to dispute environmental clearances and permits (16) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Out of court resolution mechanisms for environmental disputes | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| - Arbitration (17) | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.66 |
| - Conciliation (18) | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.66 |
| - Mediation (18) | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.66 |
| Total points | 2 | 2 | 4 |

^{*}Shared indicators between property transfer, building permits and environmental permits

| PILLAR II-QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION | | | |
|--|--|--|--|
| Parameters | | | |
| Largest city | The largest (most populous) city in the economy. Geographical location determines the agency governing environmental clearances, as well as the type of clearances required. For all questions in Pillar II, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se. | | |
| Project type, size | The type and size of project (housing development project) determines the type of environmental permitting required. A specific parameter of the construction of a new residential dwelling housing development project is provided, with a total surface area of residential housing development project of 10 acres (40,468 sqm). The type of residence considered is detached single family house with 1, 2, and 3 bedrooms, each with its own driveway, and the estimated number of houses are 100 single family homes, with an estimated 600 residents. | | |

2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF ONLINE SERVICES

2.1.1 Building Permits and Environmental Licenses–Digital Public Services

20. Please indicate whether there is an electronic system that facilitates the processing of environmental licenses in [B-READY largest city] for each of the following:

20a. Online payment

20b. Online communication

20c. Online notification

20d. Online submission

20e. Auto-generated checklist

21. Can final decisions on environmental clearances/licenses be disputed online? (Y/N)

| 2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF ONLINE SERVICES | | | |
|--|------|------|--------------|
| 2.1.1 Building Permits and Environmental Licenses-Digital Public Services | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Electronic system to submit environmental licenses | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Online payment (20a) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Online communication (20b) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Online notification (20c) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Online submission (20d) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| - Auto-generated checklist (20e) | 0.20 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| Mechanism available to file a dispute online on the final decision on environmental licensing (21) | | | 2 |
| Total points | 2 | 2 | 4 |

2.2 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION

2.2.1 Transparency of Information on Building Permits and Environmental Licenses

- 22. Are the requirements for submitting an application to obtain an environmental license for constructing a building with moderate environmental risk in [B-READY largest city] available online? (Y/N)
- 23. Is the applicable fee schedule for obtaining any type of environmental clearances in [B-READY largest city] available online? (Y/N)
- 24. Are there official, updated and publicly available online statistics that track the number of environmental impact assessments (EIA)? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 25. How many years of statistics tracking the number and type of EIAs in [B-READY economy] are available?
 - 25a. Available for 1 year
 - 25b. Available for 2 years
 - 25c. Available for 3 years
 - 25d. Available for 4 years

- Available for 5 years or more (25e)

25e. Available for 5 years or more

| 2.2.1 Transparency of Information on Building Permits and Environmental Licenses | | | |
|--|---------|---------|---------|
| | | | |
| Public online availability of requirements (22) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Applicable fee schedule (23) | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Publicly available statistics | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| - Available for 1 year (25a) OR | 0.20 OR | 0.20 OR | 0.40 OR |
| - Available for 2 years (25b) OR | 0.40 OR | 0.40 OR | 0.80 OR |
| - Available for 3 years (25c) OR | 0.60 OR | 0.60 OR | 1.20 OR |
| - Available for 4 years (25d) OR | 0.80 OR | 0.80 OR | 1.60 OR |

2

| Total points | 3 | 3 | 6 |
|--------------|---|----|---|
| Total points | • | S. | U |

| PILLAR III-EFFICIENCY OF OBTAINING A BUILDING PERMIT IN PRACTICE | | | |
|--|---|--|--|
| Parameters | | | |
| Largest city | The largest (most populous city) in the economy. Geographical location determines the agency governing environmental clearances, as well as the type of clearances required. For all questions in Pillar III, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se. | | |
| Project-type, size | The type and size of project (housing development project of 10 acres, 100 houses, 600 residents) determines the type of environmental permitting required and cost. | | |

The data on the indicators for Pillar III will be normalized to a common unit—for example, on the scale from 0 to 100 points, where 0 represents the lowest and 100 represents the best performance. In turn, best (worst) performance is defined by the highest (lowest) standards and/or practices, measured as a single point or range of values.

The data for Pillar III on the Efficiency of Environmental Permits will be collected primarily through expert consultations using the following parameters and questions:

26. For this housing development project what kind of environmental clearances would be required?

Note: Based on the type of environmental assessment or clearance you have selected in question 48, please select only relevant processes that would be required according to your economy's environmental regulation.

- 26a. Self-declaration of compliance with environmental regulations
- 26b. Certificate of Environmental Clearance
- 26c. Simplified environmental impact assessment (i.e., environmental permit involving environmental study with limited scope)
- 26d. Full environmental impact assessment (see glossary for definition)
- 26e. No licensing requirements apply to such project
- 26f. Other (please specify)

Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Process

27. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete each of the following steps:

- 27a. Development of Terms of Reference (TOR)
- 27b. Obtain approval of TORs
- 27c. Hire registered environmental expert or company to prepare the EIA
- 27d. Environmental scoping/screening
- 27e. Preparation of the environmental study/report
- 27f. Obtain environmental license/permit/authorization
- 27g. Other (please specify)

28. On average, how much does it cost (in local currency) to complete each of the following steps:

- 28a. Development of Terms of Reference (TOR)
- 28b. Obtain approval of TORs
- 28c. Hire registered environmental expert or company to prepare the EIA

- 28d. Environmental scoping/screening
- 28e. Preparation of the environmental study/report
- 28f. Obtain environmental license/permit/authorization
- 28g. Other (please specify)
- 29. For a project as described in the parameters above, is a wastewater runoff clearance required? (Y/N)
- 30. On average, how many calendar days does it take to obtain the wastewater runoff clearance?
- 31. On average, how much does it cost (in local currency) to obtain the wastewater runoff clearance?

Public participation and reporting

- 32. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete each of the following steps:
 - 32a. Public consultation during the scoping phase of the project
 - 32b. Public consultation during the preparation of the EIA
 - 32c. Public consultation after the completion of the EIA
 - 32d. Other (please specify)
- 33. On average, how much does it cost (in local currency) complete each of the following steps:
 - 33a. Public consultation during the scoping phase of the project
 - 33b. Public consultation during the preparation of the EIA
 - 33c. Public consultation after the completion of the EIA
 - 33d. Other (please specify)

Monitoring of EIA Implementation

- **34.** Is there a post-audit of the EIA implementation? (Y/N)
- 35. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete the post-audit of the EIA implementation?
- 36. On average, how much does it cost (in local currency) to conduct the post-audit of the EIA implementation?

Environment Management Plan

- 37. Based on the law, and the type of environmental clearance required, would an Environmental Management Plan (EMP) be required? (Y/N)
- 38. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete each of the following steps:
 - 38a. Preparation of EMP
 - 38b. Monitoring of the EMP implementation
 - 38c. Obtain final clearance
 - 38d. Other (please specify)
- 39. On average, how much does it cost (in local currency) to complete each of the following steps:
 - 39a. Preparation of EMP
 - 39b. Monitoring of the EMP implementation
 - 39c. Obtain final clearance

40. What is the total time to complete all steps to obtain environmental licenses?

Note: Please consider the time indicated above for all EIA or EIA process, public participation and report, monitoring of EIA implementation and Environmental Management plan, if applicable). Please also consider the simultaneity of steps: that is, whether certain steps can be completed at the same time. For instance, if two steps can be completed within the same day, then the total time for both steps will only be 1 day.

41. What is the total cost (in local currency) to complete the entire process of obtaining environmental clearances?

Note: Pease consider the cost indicated above for all EIA or EIA process, public participating and report, monitoring of EIA implementation and Environmental Management plan (if applicable).

| 3.1 TIME | | | |
|--|------------|------|--------------|
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Time to Obtain Environmental Permits (40) Further corroborated with data from 27, 28, 30, 32, 35, 38 | 100 (100%) | n.a. | 100 (100%) |
| 3.2 COST | | | |
| Indicators | FFP | SBP | Total points |
| Cost to Obtain Environmental Permits (41) Further corroborated with data from 28, 31, 33, 36, 39 | 100 (100%) | n.a. | 100 (100%) |
| Total points | 100 | n.a | 100 |

Note: n.a. = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = firm flexibility point; SBP = social benefit point.